

The Impact of the Use of New Communications and Information Technologies on Trafficking in Human Beings for Sexual Exploitation

A Study of the Users

Donna M. Hughes
University of Rhode Island, USA

The Group of Specialists on the Impact of the Use of New Information Technologies on
Trafficking in Human Beings for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation (EG-S-NT)

Committee for Equality between Women and Men (CDEG)

Council of Europe
May 2001

Table of Contents

Introduction	4
Definition of trafficking for sexual exploitation.....	4
Methods.....	5
Organization of report	5
The Technologies	6
New and Old Technologies	6
Multi-Media Sex Industries.....	8
Technologies of the Near Future	8
Wireless Internet access	9
Internet Venues, Applications and Services	9
Sex Industries and Perpetrators	10
Newsgroups.....	10
Web message and bulletin boards	10
Web sites	10
Chat rooms	10
File transfer protocol	11
Search engines.....	11
Peer to peer networks and file swapping programs.....	11
Encryption	12
Unethical Practices	12
Anonymity and Disguise.....	13
New technologies, new capacities, and increased production and distribution.....	13
The Use of New Technologies	14
Communication Among Traffickers and Pimps.....	14
Latvian Web site for prostitution and pornographic services.....	14
Russian folk dancers forced to strip in Alaska, USA	15
Traffickers and Stalkers Contacting Victims.....	15
Traffickers recruiting victims	16
Stalking children in chat rooms.....	16
Investigation of stalking in the UK	17
U.S. girl stalked from Greece	18
Communication Between Pimps, Pornographers and Users	19
Distribution of Russian produced child pornography; Pimping Russian children	19
Pimping women on the Web	19
Communication Among Men Seeking to Sexually Exploit Women and Children	21
Latvian and Swedish child sex abusers and pornographers.....	21
Communication about buying women and girls for prostitution.....	22
Transmission of Images, Videos and Live Broadcasts.....	22
Pimping from prison by Web cam.....	22

Japanese women in live performances broadcast from U.S.	22
Rape and torture images and videos	23
Global epidemic of sexual exploitation on the Internet.....	24
Facilitation of Access to Pornography.....	25
Landslide Verification Service	25
Internet service provider guilty of knowingly providing access to child pornography	26
The Users.....	27
Internet Usage Statistics in Europe.....	27
The Collectors	28
Collectors of child pornography and the role of the Internet.....	28
Collectors of male child pornography	29
The Stalkers	29
The Buyers	30
Links between prostitution and pornography	32
The Producers.....	32
Producers of child pornography	32
Producers of adult pornography	33
Budapest – Pornography production capital.....	34
The Consumers.....	35
Workplace Users	36
The Unintended Users	38
The Future User.....	39
The Challenges.....	40
Denial of the Harm	40
Disconnection Between Acts and Images	42
References	44

Introduction

The trafficking in women and children for sexual exploitation is a global human rights crisis being perpetrated by individual criminals and organized crime groups, and facilitated by increased tolerance for the sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of women and children. The favored destination countries for trafficked women are the wealthy states of Western Europe, although women and children are trafficked to wherever there is a demand for them, such as areas with large groups of military personnel, as in the Balkans. The slavery, debt bondage, and sexual exploitation of women and children in brothels, bars and strip clubs is starting to get the attention it so urgently needs.

There are other sites for the stalking and sexual exploitation of women and child. Here, women and children are stalked by sexual predators, women are recruited by traffickers, pimps communicate and plan their crimes, men exchange information on how to find and sexually exploit women and children, people buy, sell and freely exchange millions of images and videos of sexual exploitation and abuse of women and children, and individual entrepreneurs and big corporations grow rich from these acts of sexual exploitation and abuse. Unlike the brothels and strip clubs in distant places, these sites can be easily brought into the average home, and users can access every type of sexual exploitation and abuse imaginable in minutes. How many of these victims meet the legal criteria to be considered a victims of trafficking is unknown.

New communications and information technologies have created a global revolution in communications, access to information, and media delivery. There are a lot of positive aspects to the global revolution, but there are also some very negative ones. This report describes the most negative ones—how communications and information technologies are used to facilitate the trafficking of women and children for sexual exploitation.

The topic of trafficking for sexual exploitation is made up of two related, but legally separate, concepts. Definitions of “trafficking” and “sexual exploitation” are debated with widely different views as to what constitutes a victim of “trafficking” or “sexual exploitation.” This report is not about legal definitions. In fact, many of the women and children’s experiences fall into gray areas, rather to conform to precise definitions. Also, much of the research on sexual exploitation and the Internet deals with images, and the people in the images are not available to be interviewed and asked questions to clarify their experiences, their consent or coercion, their freedom or slavery.

Definition of trafficking for sexual exploitation

The most agreed upon definition of trafficking in women and children for purposes of sexual exploitation was reached in December 2000 for the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime*. In this *Protocol*, “sexual exploitation” is not defined.

(a) ‘Trafficking in persons’ shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, or abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments of benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs;

(b) The consent of the victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) have been used.

(c) The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a child for the purpose of sexual exploitation shall be considered “trafficking in persons” even if this does not involve any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article;

(d) “Child” shall mean any person under eighteen years of age.

Methods

For this report I gathered information from the following sources in member states of the Council of Europe and the United States: 1) interviews with law enforcement officials, 2) interviews with researchers of trafficking, prostitution, pornography, and child sexual abuse, 3) interviews with computer industry consultants, 4) reports written by law enforcement personnel, researchers and NGOs, 5) media news stories; 6) content analysis of men’s writings from the Internet about their sexual exploitation of women, 7) unsolicited email from men, and 8) original research on the Internet.

Most of people I interviewed only had partial information. Although, they had expertise in one area, such as computer crime, they knew nothing about another aspect of my inquiry, such as trafficking. I talked to experts on trafficking who knew nothing about technology or the Internet. At this point, law enforcement agencies are not looking at the way technology is used for trafficking. One agent told me that those investigating trafficking were looking at things like visa fraud, and those investigating computer crime were looking at hacking and economic crimes. The only people who had knowledge of both computer technologies and sexual exploitation were those investigating child pornography or child stalking, but they knew little about trafficking for prostitution or adult sexual exploitation. In response to my inquiry on the links between trafficking and new communications and information technologies, one person told me, “People are not looking at it. It is an example of the bad folks being ahead of us. You are not wrong on this. I think it’s happening, we just haven’t caught up.”¹

Organization of report

This report is organized into four main sections. The first section, “The New Technologies,” describes the new communications and information technologies, and their features and usefulness to those engaging in sexual exploitation of women and children. The second section, “The Use of New Technologies,” describes *how* different perpetrators of trafficking and sexual exploitation and users of sexually exploited and abused women and children use the new technologies. The third section, “The Users,” describes *who* the users are. The final section, “The Challenges,” describes the challenges society faces in confronting and ending trafficking and the sexual exploitation and abuse of women and children.

The Technologies

This section will describe new communication and information technologies, applications and services and how their features are used to facilitate the trafficking and sexual exploitation of women and children. It is not an exhaustive list. As types of media, media formats and applications increase they are all used separately, in combination, and for different purposes at different times. This report will not attempt to categorize all these types and uses, but describe the most common and a few of the newest uses of these technologies for the trafficking and sexual exploitation of women and children.

New communications technologies and services (the hardware), technology formats and information and computer applications (software) enable users to communicate and transmit files. None of these new technologies are in and of themselves harmful, but they provide those who wish to harm or exploit women and children new, efficient and, often anonymous, ways of doing that.

New and Old Technologies

Television and cable are not new technologies, but they are being combined with new technologies to create new ways of delivering information, news, and entertainment. Web TV combines the television with the Internet. New cable networks use satellite transmission to deliver hundreds of channels and Direct TV delivers content on demand.

One doesn't usually think of mainstream communications, like cable TV, in connection with trafficking in women, but according to Paul Fishbein, owner of *Adult Video News*, anything sells. "There are so many outlets [for the videos] that even if you spend just US\$15,000 and two days – and put in some plot and good-looking people and decent sex--you can get satellite and cable sales. There are so many companies, and they rarely go out of business. You have to be really stupid or greedy to fail."² There is a high demand for pornographic videos. Only one of eight major cable companies in the U.S. doesn't offer pornographic movies. Satellite and cable companies say that the more sexually explicit the content the greater the demand. *Adult Video News* reports that pornography offerings on TV by satellite or cable are increasing video store sales and rentals, not decreasing them, as might be expected. The explanation is that pornography on TV is increasing the total market by finding new buyers. Several cases described later in this report demonstrate the connection between trafficking for stripping, prostitution and video production.³

Although, the Internet is becoming the primary way to transmit child pornography, the old-fashioned way of sending content--the mail--is still used by perpetrators, now in combination with Internet technology. Raymond Smith, U.S. Postal Inspection Service, still handles hundreds of cases of child pornography, and has found that the increased use of the Internet by paedophiles has increased their use of the U.S. mail as well. He said that from the time they first started investigating child pornography in the early 1980s until five years ago they decreased the distribution of child pornography. Then the Internet was invented. Since then the number of cases connected to the Internet has steadily increased. In 1998, 32 percent of cases were Internet connected. In 1999, 47 percent were Internet connected, and last year, 2000, 77 percent were Internet connected.⁴

Producers of child pornography advertise their videos on the Internet and distribute them through the mail. Men in chat rooms trade small files—still images and short movie clips--on the Internet, but

ship videos by mail. Stalkers talk to children in chat rooms, ask them to take pictures of themselves, and send them through the mail. When stalkers get children to travel to meet them, they send them bus and plane tickets through the mail.⁵

Scanners and video digitizers are used to turn old pornographic images, films and videos into electronic format that can be uploaded to the Internet. About half of the child pornography online is old images from films and magazines produced in the 1960s and 70s.⁶ Digital cameras and recorders enable the making of images that don't need to be professionally processed, thereby eliminating the risk of detection. These new types of equipment also make it technologically easier for people to become producers of pornography. Digital media formats are no longer static and independent. One format can be quickly converted into another. Videos are still the primary production medium for child pornography, and the still images for the Internet are produced by video capture.⁷ From one video, 200–300 still images can be taken then uploaded to a newsgroup or Web site or traded one image at a time. According to the COPINE (Combating Paedophile Information Networks in Europe) Project, production of child pornography still combines older methods of production, while using new Internet technologies for distribution.

“At the moment the underground production of video child pornography may run parallel with, but be essentially unrelated to, Internet technologies for its distribution... This may well change, however, as digital photography becomes more widely available.”⁸

Police in the Internet law enforcement project in New Hampshire, USA reported an increase in the production of child pornography along with the development of new technologies.

It is safe to say that the number of manufactures [producers of child pornography] has increased over the years with the availability of new medium. Home development of black and white 35MM film, self-developing Polaroid film, video cameras, camcorders, computer scanners, CUseeme technology and now computer cameras (including video) have made child pornography easier and easier to produce and reproduce.

One police analysis noted that prior to the Internet the majority of collectors of child pornography did not distribute because duplication technology was not readily available. Now, making copies of image files “involves a few clicks of any computer mouse allowing for effortless distribution.”⁹

Digital Video Disk (DVD) provides high quality videos and interactive capabilities for the viewer. While making the videos, scenes can be shot from multiple angles, and all points of view added to the CD ROM. The viewer can then choose the version, point of view, or camera angle he/she prefers. Viewers can watch the movie in chronological order, moving from one character to the next, or watch the movie from one character's point of view. Viewers can interact with DVD movies in much the same way they do with video games, giving them a more active role.¹⁰ According to one producer:

“If a viewer wants something different, we give it to him. ...The viewer can go inside the head of the person having sex with _____, male or female. He can choose which character to follow. He can re-edit the movie. ... It's a great technology....”¹¹

The following is a description of a recent pornographic movie recorded on DVD:

“Chasing Stacy from VCA Labs, is a choose-your-own-adventure flick that follows Stacy the porn star as she signs autographs, drinks coffee, works out at the gym and takes a shower. At various points, a small green icon appears in the corner of the screen and Stacy looks straight at the camera. That's when viewers get the chance to ask Stacy out on a virtual date by pressing the Enter button on the DVD remote control. The date scenes are filmed so that the viewer feels like he's sitting directly across a glass table from Stacy, who provides insights into her personal life. Later, the viewer can select whether to take Stacy back to her house, to her office, or to another locale for a tryst. With the remote control, the details can be chosen as the action unfolds.”¹²

The pornography producer, VCA, released this DVD in July 2000 and sold more than 12,000 copies by January 2001, making it the fastest selling title they have.¹³

Although techniques like this have many applications and enable creativity and interactivity, it raises the question of the impact this has on people and their relationships and expectations of relationships. A portion of men who seek out women in prostitution do so because of their lack of social skills, or their misogynistic attitudes prevent them from establishing relationships with their peers. (See the later section on denial of the harm.) Technology such as this may further distance some men from meaningful relationships.

Multi-Media Sex Industries

Sex industries are embracing all technologies--old, new, and combined--to deliver their "adult content" to consumers.

In the U.S., radio stations that broadcast over the Internet have entered the sex industry market. KSEXradio is the first all "adult sex-talk" Internet radio station. Launched in July 2000 from California, it claims to be the "only station in the world that talks about sex 24 hours a day." On one day--9 January 2001--it was accessed 108,810 times. The station is free for listeners and supported by advertising from the sex industry. At the Web site there is a chat room for listeners to talk to one another.¹⁴

In Europe, the two biggest sex industry companies have multiple media outlets for their products. Beate Uhse, Europe's largest pornography company was listed on the Frankfurt stock market in 1999.

*"[Beate Uhse] operates more than 50 Beate Uhse sex shops in Germany and nearly 95 in Austria, Italy, Spain, and Switzerland ...and about 45 Erotic Discount Centers in the Netherlands and Belgium. Other operations include wholesale and manufacturing businesses, an erotica mail-order business (Europe's largest), and, of course, an Internet porn network with more than 140 domain names. The company also runs the Museum of Erotica in Berlin. It is planning an adult pay-TV venture in Europe and expansion in the U.S.."*¹⁵

From Barcelona, Spain, Private Media, another large sex industry company, which is listed on the NASDAQ, offers its content in a wide variety of media venues, but is increasingly moving into the high end Internet and satellite market.

*"Private Media Group publishes a handful of adult magazines, including flagship Private (which was the world's first legal hard-core sex magazine), as well as Pirate and Private Sex. It also acquires and distributes adult videos and has more than 260 titles in its library. In addition, the company publishes CD-ROMs, DVDs, and games; sells adult-themed products on a Swedish TV shopping channel; licenses filmed content and sex products to third parties, including Playboy; and operates more than 20 adult Web sites. Other operations include a clothing line, an energy drink, and an online casino. Most of its sales come from Sweden and Spain."*¹⁶

These large companies are increasingly mainstreaming pornographic material. By their size, public listings on stock exchanges, and profit making, they are legitimizing the sex industry.

Technologies of the Near Future

The following technologies are being marketed, although they have not yet achieved wide spread use. Technologies are not always adopted in poorer regions in the same time frame or sequence as they are in wealthier regions. For example, when I was in Bangladesh I was surprised at the number of people

who had mobile phones in such a poor country. Then someone explained that very few people have landline telephones, because the infrastructure doesn't exist. Yet, for comparatively little money, many can get a mobile cell phone. In this poor country, the landline technology that has existed in wealthier Western countries will probably never be built. They will make the leap to new technologies. The same lack of technological sequencing may happen in poorer regions of Europe.

Wireless Internet access

Every new information technology that has been invented in the past two decades has quickly been used to deliver sexual content. A 20-year-old college student has developed a new "adult content delivery system"--the porno Palm. His service allows owners of Palm Pilots, the hand held computer organizers, to use them for reading and viewing pornography. The new service, called Palmstories, is offered on a subscription-based channel on the Internet. Each day subscribers can download pornographic text and images to take with them for the day. Because of low screen resolution and small memory the images are low quality, for now. Still, 8,000 people have signed up for the free demonstration. The users are mostly business travelers. According to the developer: "They are males, mostly 18 to 35, professionals—some military, and, actually, a lot of people from foreign countries. Singapore is the second biggest subscriber after the U.S."¹⁷

Cellmania is offering a wireless directory of people who want to have phone sex, a site that publishes a "position of the week," and lots of traditional pornography. There is a "prostitute finder" for the UK that can be searched by region and physical preferences. "Field reports" from men are included. In June 2001, Penthouse Magazine will begin offering centerfolds for hand-held devices. Erotigo.com, with the slogan "sex in the palm of your hand," is offering a wireless directory to sex industry sites in New York City.¹⁸

Earlier this year there was a report of the growth of mobile Internet access in Central Europe, which may seem odd considering that mobile Internet access has not been widely adopted in Western Europe. Presently, mobile phone use in Central European countries is not far behind Western Europe. By 2005, Hungary is expected to have 66 mobile users per 100 people, and the Czech Republic 79 user per 100, the same as Germany. In the Czech Republic, Poland and Hungary, wireless application protocol (WAP) services are available. Reportedly, sales of mobile and hand held devices with these options are good. Marketing analysts believe that the simultaneous introduction and growth of Internet service and mobile phones will make the combination popular and more readily adopted in Central European countries than Western Europe.¹⁹

Internet Venues, Applications and Services

There are a number of venues and media formats with different technologies on the Internet for transfer of files and communications--Usenet newsgroups, World Wide Web, email, live synchronous communication (text and voice chat), bulletin or message boards, Web cams for live transmission of images or videos, live video conferencing (live video chat), streaming video, peer to peer servers, and file sharing programs. All forums and applications offer ways to engage in the sexual exploitation of women and children.

How each is used for sexual exploitation depends on the legality of the activity, which varies from country to country, the techniques adopted by the sex industry or individual users, and the level of privacy or secrecy attempted by the users.

Sex Industries and Perpetrators

The sex industry has aggressively adopted, and in a few cases, invented, every new communications and information technology for the marketing, selling and transmitting of pornographic materials and live sex shows. Perpetrators have also taken advantage of each new technology and application to stalk victims, transmit illegal materials, and avoid detection by law enforcement. According to one official, “If it can be done, they’re doing it.”²⁰

Newsgroups

Usenet newsgroups are still popular sites for the exchange of information about how to find women and children for sexual exploitation. Although much media attention has been given to child pornography rings and cases that use sophisticated technologies and applications to keep their activities secret, the older public newsgroups are still commonly used to upload and download child pornography. The COPINE Project reports that over 1000 illegal images are posted on newsgroups each week.²¹

Web message and bulletin boards

Web based message boards and bulletin boards are increasingly popular for exchange of information by perpetrators of sexual exploitation. They are used in much the same way as newsgroups, but can be private and protected by passwords.

Web sites

Web sites are the most popular venue for the distribution of pornography online. Large legal sex industry businesses have sophisticated sites with subscription fees that bring in millions of dollars per year. There are 10,000s of free pornography sites that are maintained by amateurs or someone making a relatively small amount of money from advertising banners for larger sites and businesses. Recently, there has been a downturn in the online sex industry and one of the explanations given was that the Web was so saturated with sex industry sites, including free sites, that the larger businesses were making less money.

Web sites can now offer streaming videos that can be viewed with Web browsers. The most recent versions of Web browsers (e.g. Internet Explorer, Netscape) come packaged with these plug-ins.

Chat rooms

Real time synchronous communication or “chat” is a popular means of communication on the Internet. Chat is available through Internet Relay Chat (IRC) channels, Instant Messaging, such as ICQ, Web based chat sites which are accessed through browsers, Multi-User Dimension (MUD) or Multi-User Simulated or Share Hallucination (MUSH) programs. There are over 100,000 chat rooms available to users worldwide. Some of these formats and the “rooms” they create are open to the public, some are private and require passwords, and others are used for one to one communication. No messages are archived or stored and no log files are maintained, as is done with emails or Web accesses, so stalkers use them to look for victims. There have been numerous cases in the U.S. and UK of predators contacting children for online and physical meetings in which children have been emotionally and sexually abused. There have been numerous cases of online stalking of adults that began with conversations in chat rooms, and led physical meetings that turned into sexual assaults. One of the friendly features of ICQ that can have dangerous implications for children being stalked is

the instant alert message that is sent out when one of the user's "buddies" logs on to the Internet. I had this feature on my computer for a while, and I found out quite quickly that I didn't want even my closest, most trusted friends to know every time I logged on!

File transfer protocol

Although one of the oldest ways of exchanging files on the Internet, ftp (file transfer protocol), is still popular with paedophiles for one to one exchange of child pornography. Ftp allows users to have direct access to another's computer hard drive to upload and download files. This technique of file exchange is most likely to occur between child pornography collectors who have met in other venues and come trust each other.

Search engines

Even the everyday search engine can contribute to the problem of sexual exploitation. Search engines are becoming more sophisticated and powerful in indexing the content of cyberspace. As a result users seeking particular types of pornography, women, children, locations, etc. can find it faster and with more precision. As a computer industry consultant said, "The discerning pornography users can find it faster. They no longer have to just stumble upon it."²²

Peer to peer networks and file swapping programs

In the last year, a new technology was developed and released as freeware that can create a network of peer computers. The result is an open, decentralized, peer-to-peer system. File swapping programs are used to find files on the network. Using the program the user designates one directory on his/her computer that will be open to the public and another for downloaded files. When the user logs onto the Internet, he/she will be automatically connected to all other people running the same program. All available files are indexed into a large searchable database. When keywords are entered the request moves from one computer to the next returning links to files. Then the program can download the requested files from other member's network computers.²³ It is being touted as a revolution in how computers and people communicate with each other on the Internet. Examples are: Napster, Scour Exchange, Gnutella, Freenet, Imesh.

These programs create a decentralized system, meaning there is no central server through which all communications pass. Consequently, there are no logs of transmissions, and transmissions are not traceable because each site can only trace the connection back one level. You can enter the public network or create a private one of your own.²⁴ These features are what make this new information technology so attractive to perpetrators.

"[S]oftware that turn your PC into both a client and a server. They'll create a true Web by allowing users to easily connect directly to each other. ... Download Gnutella and you can trade any type of file, pirated or not, with anybody else on the Gnutella network in virtual anonymity."²⁵

Another program, called Freenet, claims to take anonymity one step further by disguising the user as well.²⁶

Gnutella has a monitoring feature that allows the user to see what people are searching for. According to Glenn Nick, U.S. Customs Cyber Smuggling Center "most searches on these networks are for adult and child pornography."²⁷

Encryption

When criminal activity on the Internet is talked about, encryption is always mentioned as a technology likely to be adopted to disguise the content of files. Several law enforcement officials in UK and the U.S. indicated that at this point the capabilities and threat of encryption seemed to be talked about more than it is used. Encryption programs are not easy to use, and other methods of hiding activity or content are more popular. According to analyst, “the frequency of use is much exaggerated at present.”

Unethical Practices

The sex industry has adopted many unethical practices to draw attention to their Web sites, and trap users once they are there. The sex industry advertises through banners on search engines, Web sites with free pornography, and spam-unsolicited email. Almost everyone with an email account has received unsolicited email messages with advertising from the sex industry. “Click here for XXX.” The goal of the “spammers” is to send millions of spam to accounts each day. They have no way of knowing who is receiving their messages. Children are as likely to get a pornographic spam as an adult. Spam costs Internet service providers millions of dollars by using their bandwidth, clogging their systems, and taking time to responding to angry customers. Even with aggressive efforts to block spam, a few spams consistently get through the traps.

The sex industry uses techniques such as “page jacking” and “mouse trapping” to pull in people who had no intention of visiting a pornographic Web site, then trapping them there as page after page of pornography opens up when the viewer tries to leave the site. Page jacking is a technique the sex industry uses to misdirect users so they mistakenly come to their Web sites. They include false key word descriptions or meta-tags on their Web pages so that search engines index the pages under those false descriptors. The users will then click on the link of their chosen topic, only to find themselves on a pornographic Web site.

Pornographers are very aggressive about using popular current events and search subjects to misdirect viewers. There seems to be hardly any topic the sex industry hasn’t exploited to draw traffic to their sites. Pornographers will even exploit the arrests of other pornographers. For example, when my research assistant was looking for news reports about the break-up of a child pornography ring in Russia, she found that entering the case related keyword directed her to Web sites with child pornography.²⁸

Once intended or unintended viewers are on pornographic sites, the sex industry traps them on their pornographic sites using a technique known as “mouse-trapping.” Sex industry Web page designers disable browser commands, such as “back” or “close,” so that viewers cannot leave the site. When these buttons are clicked, another pornographic Web site opens up, resulting in endless numbers of pages opening on the viewer’s screen. I’ve had one pornographic Web site change the default homepage setting on my browser, so the next time I opened the browser I was taken directly to their pornographic site. Fortunately, I knew how to reset the home page of my browser. Other less experienced users may be forced for a time to use a browser with a pornographic home page. Also, the sex industry has no idea who they are trapping on their Web sites, whether they are children or those who fervently do not want to view pornography.

Anonymity and Disguise

For those engaging in criminal activity anonymity, disguise or difficulty tracing their communication is critical. In an attempt to avoid being traced, criminals can send their communication through a series of carriers, each using different communications technologies, such as local telephone companies, long distance telephone companies, Internet service providers, wireless networks, and satellite networks. They can send the communication through a number of different countries in different time zones, where it is night in at least one place. This complicated routing makes the communication difficult to trace for technical, bureaucratic, political, and logistical reasons. In an attempt to avoid being identified, criminals can send their messages through a series of anonymous re-mailers who strip off identifying headers and replace them with new ones. One re-mailer service removed identifying features from the header, then held all incoming message until five minutes after the hour, then resent them in random order in order to make tracing an individual message more difficult. Messages could be sent through five to twenty other re-mailers with at least one located in a country known for its lack of cooperation with the global community and law enforcement.

Users of cellular and satellite phones can be located far from their home bases and still use their phones. Mobile phones can be programmed to transmit false identification. Also, criminals can sign up for mobile phone services, then throw the phone away after a short period of time or after a specific crime is committed. Pre-paid phone cards also can be used anonymously.

New technologies like Web TV, in which Web communications are displayed on a TV, don't have a file cache, like browsers installed on a computer. Therefore, no illegal material will be accidentally left in the cache to be discovered by police.²⁹

New technologies, new capacities, and increased production and distribution

New communications and information technologies have invigorated and enabled the trading, marketing and production of adult and child pornography. The new technologies have moved these activities into the home, where images can be scanned, produced, uploaded and downloaded in privacy. Even with the new production technologies, one of the earlier problems was storage space because of the size of the files, but now with zip and jazz drives, CDs and high capacity hard drives that isn't a problem. Perpetrators also use off-site or "cyber space" storage, meaning they use other's computers clandestinely to store their files.

Transmission of files has become easier and there are more ways to disguise oneself. Improved Internet connections, such as cable modems, make it even faster. All of these technologies have made it easier to produce, store and distribute image of sexual exploitation.

The Use of New Technologies

This section will describe *how* users and perpetrators use new communication and information technologies to sexually exploit and traffic women and children. This section is divided into sections according to the users and how they used new technologies to carry out their activities. A few case examples are provided.

All users want something different from the technology. Users seek different features from technologies. Criminals seek disguise and anonymity to knowingly commit crimes. Business and family men want privacy to engage in activities that may not be illegal, but considered immoral in their communities. Power users want speed, convenience and novelty. When the content or activity is sexual there is no consensus, no norms, and no homogenized laws to set a standard. What is legal in one country is illegal in another. Even laws that criminalize certain activities focus on different actions.

Communication Among Traffickers and Pimps

There is little documentation of the use of new information technologies for criminal purposes by traffickers and pimps, but there is no reason to assume they aren't using the latest technologies for their transnational or local activities. It is known that pimps use pagers and mobile phones to communicate to and control women and girls. Pimps also use mobile phones for surveillance. In street prostitution, they have lookouts to watch for approaching police patrol cars.³⁰

Criminals in general are using new communications technologies, such as mobile phones, to avoid police being able to trace phone calls. Mobile phone services often offer free or cheap phones for signing up for their services. Criminals use these phones for a weekend or a week, then throw them away. Pre-paid phone cards enable anonymous use of land line telephone systems. Trafficking and exploitation of people requires a lot of coordination--the recruiting, planning, traveling, meetings and transferring of people numerous times. It is likely they are using new technologies for ease of communication and to avoid detection.

In this case, the use of new technologies may not have increased the trafficking of people, but it has made the activities easier. One man said:

"We would be very careful about saying that information technologies are linked to increased trafficking. We think it is a facilitator rather than a creator, making what would have happened anyway easier. It has made it easier (and therefore quicker) to do this."³¹

As more cases of trafficking are uncovered, the details of their operations will mostly like reveal an increased use of electronic communications.

Latvian Web site for prostitution and pornographic services

Since the early 1990s, Western producers of pornography have gone to Latvia to find vulnerable children and young adults to sexually exploit in their videos. In August 1999 the Vice Police in Latvia initiated criminal proceedings against the owners of Logo Center "modeling agency" for production of pornography and the use of minors in the production of pornography. The two managers of the Logo Center provided women and children to foreign prostitution tourists and foreign pornography

producers. They had several Web sites (logosagency.com, pronorussian.nu, marige.nu, and logosagency.nu) with pornography, information about minors, and photographs of their “models” in different sex acts. Since the center opened they had exploited 2000 women, men, girls and boys; resulting in 174 juveniles relying on prostitution for their basic livelihood.

The Logo Center supplied women and children for pornography production in other countries. In one case they supplied “porno models” to a Swedish pornography producer who made the videos in Finland. The Logo Center also had a stall for their products in the largest sex shop in Sweden.

The Logo Center Web site had links to other sites with bestiality and child pornography. The two owners were charged with distribution of child pornography.³²

Russian folk dancers forced to strip in Alaska, USA

There is one case of trafficking of women for sexual exploitation that involves the use of email. In January 2000, U.S. Immigration and Naturalization Services agents uncovered a case of trafficking in Alaska in which two Russian girls (aged 16 and 17) and five women were forced to strip and perform table dancing in a strip club in Anchorage.³³ The girls and women had been recruited in Moscow by a dance instructor from Krasnodar, Russia, a city of about 700,000 in southern Russia near the Black Sea.³⁴ The women were told they would perform Russian folk dances, and were given some dance lessons before leaving Russia. Upon arrival in Alaska, their passports were confiscated, and they were told that the cultural performances opportunity had disappeared. The women were taken to the Crazy Horse Club where, at first, they performed Russian folk dances, clothed in traditional costumes. Then they changed into “stripper clothes” and performed table dances for tips. Within days, they were coerced into dancing topless and then nude. The women received tips for the dancing, but all the money was turned over to the manager.

Of the four people involved in trafficking the women, two were Americans who housed the women and made the arrangements at the club, one was Georgian, and the dance instructor was Russian. Before the case was uncovered, the 16-year-old girl attempted to disfigure herself and was suicidal.³⁵ The case was discovered after the Crazy Horse Club advertised on the radio that exotic dancers from Russia would be performing. The defendants communicated by email to organize the trafficking and set-up the arrangements. A search of the apartment where they women were housed found equipment to make pornographic movies. An agent involved in the case thought the women would probably have been coerced into making pornography.³⁶

Traffickers and Stalkers Contacting Victims

Traffickers and stalkers use the Internet in a number of ways to contact and recruit victims. There are many sites and forums on the Internet for adults to engage in sex talk, but child stalkers seek out children for the purpose of engaging in age inappropriate graphic sex talk to provide sexual satisfaction for the perpetrator. Often the child stalkers will escalate by enticing the child to engage in more sexual activity, sometimes resulting in the perpetrator meeting the child. Perpetrators have also used various Internet forums to stalk adult victims. Crimes range from online harassment to physical stalking and sexual assault. Offenders have precipitated the victimization of adults and children by third parties by posting messages, supposedly from the victims, asking for men to come and rape them or use them for prostitution.

Traffickers recruiting victims

There seems to be some evidence that traffickers use the Internet to recruit women from sending regions to traffic them to Western Europe. A report by the Denmark Police notes suspicious advertisements for nannies, waitresses and dancers on Web sites in Latvia and Lithuania.³⁷ The traffickers used Internet sites to post job advertisements for jobs in Western Europe just as they do in magazines and newspapers. The magazine ads give mobile phone numbers for contacts, while the Internet sites give email addresses.

The significance of these Internet advertisements in the recruitment of women was disputed. Some thought that so few girls and women have Internet access in Latvia and Lithuania, especially in the poor, rural areas from which many girls/women are recruited, that this could not be an effective recruitment tool. Others thought that almost all girls or women would have access to the Internet through schools and libraries, where they may go to search for work abroad.³⁸ In Latvia, according to police sources, the women most vulnerable to recruitment were young women, aged 19 to 22, living in extreme poverty primarily in the southern and Russian part of Latvia where unemployment is high and the prospects for the future are poor. The destinations for the women from Latvia are primarily Germany and Scandinavia, but also include Great Britain, the Netherlands, Spain, Italy, Greece, Cyprus, Switzerland and Iceland. For the women from Lithuania, Poland is a transit country and Germany is considered to be the primary destination country, although many women are distributed to other European countries, especially Spain, the Netherlands, and Israel from there. Law enforcement sources believe there is a national network of recruiters in Lithuania with connections to international trafficking networks.³⁹

In Brazil in 2000, police in Rio de Janeiro discovered a widely circulated email trying to recruit Brazilian women to go to Spain. There are an estimated 75,000 Brazilian women in prostitution in Europe; many of them have been trafficked. Police acknowledged that it was difficult for them to investigate Web sites and email messages that come from outside Brazil. There were also advertisements on Web sites that offered Brazilian women US\$1000 a month to go abroad. Authorities in Brazil are seeing increasing numbers of Web sites that are used as recruiting tools for traffickers.⁴⁰

Stalking children in chat rooms

Stalkers use various forums on the Internet to contact, entice, meet, assault and exploit victims of all ages. There have been numerous cases of perpetrators stalking children online in chat rooms. There are nearly 5 million children using the Internet in the UK. Chat rooms are popular with teens, especially girls, who use it to communicate with their friends. In the UK, Internet users are perceived to be “clever, cool and trendy,” rather than “geeks,” a previous image. One survey found that teenagers in the UK spend an average 191 minutes/month on one instant messaging service alone.⁴¹ In the UK, the children that are at highest risk for “online enticement” by child stalkers are teenagers, mainly girls, between ages 13 and 17.

There are country and cultural differences in use of new information technologies. For example, in contrast to the UK trend where more girls use chat, in the U.S. and Canada, 60 percent of chat users are male.⁴²

Children using chat are vulnerable to child stalkers who make contact with children online for various criminal or harmful purposes. Perpetrators engage children in age inappropriate sexual conversation or expose them to age inappropriate sexual material, including adult and child pornography. Predators

sexually exploit children online through sexual talk, making the children the subjects of their sexual fantasy. Perpetrators ask children to send them pictures or sexual images of themselves or their friends. They may encourage the children to perform sex acts on themselves or friends for the stalker's sexual satisfaction. Stalkers use these activities as part of a grooming process to entice children into more direct contact, such as telephone conversations and eventual physical meetings.⁴³

When the child stalkers use voice chat they encourage the children to get headphones to reduce the risk of someone else in the house hearing the voices. They suggest that children get Web cameras for their computers and move their computers to their bedrooms where the man can encourage sexual touching and masturbation while the man watches over a Web cam.

“A typical ruse employed by paedophiles is when the predator asks the victim what she is wearing. This is usually followed by asking her to take something off such as her underwear. The more cunning paedophile will say something more innocuous like ‘do you enjoy taking showers,’ swiftly followed by ‘do you touch yourself in the bath?’ It is also commonplace to ask the girl if she has pubic hair in order to build up a mental picture of her level of physical maturity. The intention of most paedophiles is to engage the girl in cybersex activities.”⁴⁴

Investigation of stalking in the UK

In one case in 2000 in England, a 33-year-old man met a 14-year-old girl in a chat room. He communicated with her through email and mobile phone, then met her and raped her. He was arrested, but while on bail he was intercepted on his way to meet another 14-year-old girl he met in a chat room. He was convicted and sentenced to five years in prison. In another case in England, a 53-year-old man was convicted of sexual assault of a 13-year-old boy who contacted him through a gay counseling Web site. The man was sentenced to five years in prison.⁴⁵

There has been at least one case of a British man traveling internationally to meet a child he contacted through a chat room. In 1999, a convicted paedophile from Newcastle was arrested when he flew to the U.S. to meet a 15-year-old girl. In May 2000, police in California, USA discovered that a 28-year-old British man was trying to contact young girls in the U.S. Police from New Scotland Yard arrested him after their own investigation.⁴⁶

The user of a mobile phone in the UK reported that the first text message she received asked her if she was a girl and how old she was. She thought this might indicate that stalkers are trawling mobile numbers to find girls.⁴⁷

Last year, following the rape of a girl who was stalked online, ZDNet-UK investigated child stalker activity on Yahoo!'s Instant Messenger chat rooms.⁴⁸ They found rooms with paedophile themes such as “11-16 gals for older men,” “pics of preteen girls,” and “naked babies to fuck.”

ZDNet went into Instant Messenger chat rooms to document the chat room activities. They created a fictional 12 year old, Tina Bell, who entered chat rooms and talked to others who found her there. Within seconds of entering a chat room “Tina” was solicited for sex with adult men. The men engaged in typical grooming techniques and ruses that child stalkers use to lure children into sexualized conversations and activities. After meeting the fictional “Tina” through chat, a man named Jim had her switch to voice chat using a microphone and Internet transmission. Jim engaged “Tina” in increasingly sexualized conversation over the next month, especially on the topic of having sex with adults. According to the ZDNet investigator, Jim used his voice to instill a sense of calm in “Tina.” He never raised his voice and made “good use of vocal gestures to amuse the child. The child will

find the voice amusing and compelling. They feel they are in a real relationship with these men and see them as special.”

Richard Barry, investigator for ZDNet, reported that several times advertising banners appeared with links to hardcore pornography. He wrote the following about his research into chat rooms on Yahoo!

“That work has revealed a predatory online culture where paedophiles are able to target children using sophisticated communications technologies, speak to them, form relationships with them and in some cases actually physically abuse them.”⁴⁹

The ZDNet-UK investigator was condemned businesses and governments for their lack of accountability for the sexual abuse of children:

“Abuse of children is being inadequately dealt with by a world leader in the New Economy.”⁵⁰ Internet businesses refuse to be accountable in other countries, such as UK, even for endangerment of children, because they are based in the U.S. and cite the U.S. Constitution’s First Amendment as protection.⁵¹

U.S. girl stalked from Greece

Most cases of stalking are crimes committed by individuals that would not be considered trafficking. Interestingly, some stalking and enticement cases show indications of being ways that traffickers recruit victims for sexual exploitation.

Franz Konstantin Baehring, a 37-year-old German man living in Greece, contacted a 14-year-old girl from Florida in a chat room. He followed his Internet communication with letters by mail and telephone calls. After a year of corresponding, he convinced the girl to run away from home and come to Greece. To assist the girl in leaving home, Baehring contacted a woman at a mobile phone store and convinced her to assist an “abused girl in leaving home.” The woman met the 15 year old, gave her a programmed cell phone and drove her to a local airport. The girl flew to Ohio, where another of Baehring’s contacts, Robert Arnder, a convicted child pornographer, assisted the girl in getting a passport and leaving the U.S. Baehring paid Arnder US\$2000 for his assistance. Police were able to trace the travel and contacts of the girl by examining the email messages left on her computer at home.⁵²

Upon investigation of Robert Arnder, who assisted the girl in Ohio, they found he to had pornographic images and videos of his 13 and 17-year-old daughters on his computer. He had been sexually abusing them for at least five years. Arnder has since been indicted on 147 counts of rape, 145 counts of sexual battery, two counts of compelling prostitution, six counts of pandering obscenity involving a minor, four counts of pandering sexually oriented material involving a minor, three counts of child endangering and one count of interference with custody.⁵³

In Greece, Baehring kept the 15-year-old girl under control, locked in an apartment in Thessaloniki. She was not permitted to answer the phone or the door. The girl’s friends received email messages sent from Internet cafés in Athens and Thessaloniki saying that she was happy.⁵⁴ Baehring told his mother that he felt pity for her because she suffered from leukemia and he was trying to make her happy. He told the girl that he was a child psychologist who specialized in hypnotherapy and ran a youth center.⁵⁵

When Baehring was found, he was charged with abduction of a minor with malicious intent, sexual assault and exposing a minor to improper material.⁵⁶ Investigation of Baehring’s home found child pornography of other girls.⁵⁷ He is suspected of involvement with pornography rings on the Internet.⁵⁸

The girl suspects that Baehring may have had other girls under his control and using them in making pornography. He was previously jailed on a fraud conviction.⁵⁹

The international effort to find the missing girl involved the Polk County Sheriff's Office, U.S. State Department, U.S. Customs, U.S. Postal Inspectors, the FBI, Interpol, U.S. Embassy in Greece, the Greek Consulate and Greek police. The international cooperation has been praised, but also points out the effort needed to find one girl, and there are thousands of girls missing each year from parts of the world where such resources and cooperation don't exist.

Communication Between Pimps, Pornographers and Users

Men use email, chat rooms, and Web sites to find pornographers selling child pornography and pimping children. There are reports of advertisements in newsgroups for children to be used in the production of child pornography.⁶⁰ On password protected bulletin boards people have offered or sought children for sexual abuse.⁶¹

Distribution of Russian produced child pornography; Pimping Russian children

In February 2000, in a joint operation between Moscow City Police and U.S. Customs agents, Dimitri Kuzentsov was arrested in Moscow for molesting children in the making of pornography. Four hundred tapes, 300 of them originals used for production, were seized. U.S. Customs followed up on distribution of videos to the United States, resulting in five men being arrested. Kuzentsov made the pornography using boys who spent most of their time on the street in Moscow. The boys were easily recruited as a result of neglect or abuse by alcoholic parents. The tapes were marketed and distributed by an unemployed Russian stockbroker who bought the tapes and resold them over the Internet. The tapes were delivered by mail.⁶²

In addition to producing and distributing pornography, Kuzentsov, acted as a pimp for child prostitution tourists coming to Moscow. Men from the U.S. contacted him by email and had him make arrangements with the boys.

In another case in December 2000, Moscow City Police and U.S. Customs uncovered the Blue Orchid Web site operated by two Russians, Sergey Garbko and Vsevolod Sointsev Elbe. They domestically trafficked children from Novokuybishevsk to Moscow (a distance of 560 miles) to be used in the production of child pornography.

In March 2001, Moscow City Police arrested Victor Razumov, known as the "Punisher" on charges that he sexually abused a 15-year-old boy in the making of two videos. The videos showed the rape and sadistic abuse of a boy who was visibly crying in the films.⁶³ Four hundred videotapes, video duplication equipment, and sales and shipping records were found. Buyers, who emailed the distributor their shipping address and wired cash for payment, were identified and arrested in Sweden, Denmark, the Netherlands and the U.S.

When U.S. police searched the home of one man, they found he was on a trip to Moscow to have sex with a child. He has since been charged with molesting children between ages 10 and 14.⁶⁴

Pimping women on the Web

Some pimps and brothel owners have Web pages to advertise the women. The following is from a Web site in Prague, Czech Republic:

*Would you like to spend an exiting night in Prague with a beautiful young girl?
She will do everything for your pleasure.
She will make you happy with kissing you on your mouth, French sex and sexual intercourse.
During your stay, you can visit the "Golden City" with your girl.
The girls are pupils and students, who are financing their educations.*

Increasingly, the Web sites include photographs of the women, sometimes nude. This practice exposes women, identifying them to the public as prostitutes. Many of the photographs look like modeling photographs, and the women may never have intended for those photographs to be used to advertise them as prostitutes. Some of the women may not even know their photographs are on Web sites. Women suffer from the stigma placed on them for being in prostitution. This public display and labeling further harms women in prostitution.

Men can book sex tours and “appointments” with women through the Web, email and chat rooms. One news article reported that Italians, Germans and Americans were known to make “arrangements” prior to traveling to Rio de Janeiro, Brazil.⁶⁵

Message boards on brothels’ Web sites enable men to post “reviews” of the women for other men, and to the pimps and other men about the women’s appearances. For example:

Alina’s new photos indicate that she has gained some extra weight!! Please advise what is her weight currently.

*Thanks and regards
npp; [email address]; 09.08.00*

Dear Milla:

What happened to Alina? She seems that she gained some weight since the last time she was with you. She must not be 52Kg as written on her page. Please advise her exact weight.

Men use message boards to make reservations for their upcoming visits. A Web site for a brothel in Prague, Czech Republic had the following messages and requests:

I am an Italian guy, I am from Milan.

I knew Jana, Lena and Jessica.

I am waiting for Jana or Lena.

Last December you told me: Jana will come in house at Maj. Every week I see on your site, my hope is read about Jana or Lena.

[Email address] 21.04.01

Hallo Mila !

I found your page on the Internet.

I’m going to Prague this summer and probably will visit your establishment.

How long time before do one have to make reservations ?

Could you please put out som more photos of the girls.

Is there also possible to have analsex with the girls if you stay overnight ?

See you !

/Peter

[Email address]; Sweden; 07.07.00

I understand from our talk ,by telephone you have , 6 girls our more , ATT the time, girls are from Ukraine . I will be in Praha , late August 2000, So I will arrive to Praha . late at night , if I remember rite , me flights is from Iceland to Copenhagen and from Copenhagen to Praha . do you have some taxi our pick up from the airport ? I wold like to stay in your house the first 2 nights when I am testing your girls after that I will know which of your girls I like . , I will chosen one of them to stay in me hotel four

*2 nights , so I will have one of your girls , one hour at the time in your house before I chosen which one I chosen to stay with me in me hotel , is that ok with you ?
I understand you have 6 girls , I wold prefer to have sex with all of them , and then chosen one of the to stay in me hotel four 2 night after thatch , is thatch ok with you ?
Are your girls shaved ?
Ragnar G-----
Iceland
[Email address]; 01.07.00*

The only country for which there seems to a decline in Web advertisements for brothels and clubs is Sweden. The new Swedish law, which criminalizes the buyers of women in prostitution, has deterred public advertising for prostitution. In the *World Sex Guide*, the large public site for men to exchange information and reviews, there were only a few messages about prostitution in Sweden since 1999; all were warnings about the new law.

“Since 1/1 1999 prostitution IS ILLEGAL in Sweden. Be aware.” 14 December 1999

*“*****warning***** by Jan 1st the buying of prostitutes has become illegal and customers will be arrested the police especially ""hunts"" customers of street walkers using raids and surveillance cameras.” 27 January 2000*

Men advised others to avoid street prostitution; instead they should use Web “escort” services or go to clubs:

“Well almost to this date a year ago I sent out a warning about prostitution in Sweden.... Street action has disappeared more or less from the big cities. That's the bad news. The good news is that they've have changed to escorts from websites. Check yahoo Sweden keyword escorts.” 28 January 2000

I did a Web search for Swedish “escorts,” a popular euphemism for prostitute. There were only a few sites. There are no explicit photographs, and of the few that were there, most didn’t show the women’s faces. Most of the content of the sites is links to information on the weather in various cities in Sweden. The few Web sites that advertise “escorts” give only a mobile number.

Communication Among Men Seeking to Sexually Exploit Women and Children

Men seeking to buy women and children in prostitution and the making of pornography use forums on the Internet to exchange information about where to go and how much the women and children cost in cities all over Europe (and the rest of the world).

Latvian and Swedish child sex abusers and pornographers

Since the beginning of the 1990s men have been going to Latvia to sexually exploit women and children. In May 2000, as a result of cooperation of the Swedish and Latvian police, a Swedish citizen was detained on suspicion of sexually abusing Latvian children. His home was searched and Swedish police found a pornographic video of men sexually abusing two boys, ages 10-14. Swedish police identified two Swedish citizens and one Latvian citizen, and Latvian police identified others from the video. A Latvian citizen was charged with committing immoral acts with minors and inducing minors in the production of pornographic materials. Evidence collected in Latvia from the children in the film and the Latvian suspect was given to Swedish police, resulting in the successful prosecution of the Swedish man, as well. The Latvian and Swedish man had met and communicated their common interest in sexual abuse of boys and the making of child pornography over the Internet.⁶⁶

Communication about buying women and girls for prostitution

Men use the Usenet newsgroups, such as alt.sex.prostitution, to communicate with each other about where to go to find children for prostitution. To avoid detection, they use private chat rooms. The following are a few examples from the Web site The World Sex Guide (originally alt.sex.prostitution) for Denmark and Germany.

*' _____ ': The street where very young girls hang out. You might find 12-15 year old girls here....,"
Copenhagen, Denmark*

*"On down the street.... some younger scared looking girls in doorways. They didn't come out to talk."
1996, Berlin, Germany*

"Street girls, Some of the girls are young, really young, but don't imagine them "clean". They live more or less on the street. They will join your car. They have places which you can reach in about 10 minutes by car. Mostly empty parking lots." 2000, Frankfurt, Germany

There are several public newsgroups and Web sites dedicated to finding and “reviewing” the women and their performances. The women are referred to in misogynistic, obscene and degrading ways.

The men rate their experiences on whether they are able to obtain sex acts that women are reluctant to do because they are painful, risky, humiliating or are disgusting to the women. Men are always happy to report to each other when they find a woman who willing to give oral sex without a condom. Ejaculating on her face or in her mouth is reported as a rare and supreme achievement. When a man finds a woman he can buy who doesn't insist on a condom, he usually sees that as a stroke of luck for him. Men highly recommend women who allow them anal intercourse.

Men give negative reviews to women who are unenthusiastic or don't do what the men want. If one looks at this “lack of enthusiasm” and reluctance from the women's perspective, one can quickly see that these are not happy women, they are resisting the sexual exploitation to which they are being subjected. A number of the men describe coercing the women to do what they want anyway.

Transmission of Images, Videos and Live Broadcasts

Every venue on the Internet is used to transmit images of sexual exploitation. The number of video clips is increasing and streaming video is available for those with high-speed Internet connections. Live Web broadcasts have become common. Almost all prosecution of the production and distribution of pornography has ceased so there are few cases to describe.

Pimping from prison by Web cam

In 2000 in West Yorkshire, UK the live broadcast of prostitution was a pimp's way of monitoring and controlling an 18-year-old girl from prison. The pimp recruited an underage girl, who had been in the care of the local authority, into street prostitution. When he was arrested, he moved her to an off-street location, and set up a live Web cam for the young woman to perform live sex shows online. His intent was to watch her and continue to pimp her from prison. It is not known if his plan was successful.⁶⁷

Japanese women in live performances broadcast from U.S.

The U.S. Immigration and Naturalization Service pursued the following case, not because of the content of the broadcast or the sexual exploitation of the women, but because the women did not have the proper work permits.

In 2000, a case of smuggling/trafficking was uncovered in Hawaii, USA in which Japanese women were brought into Honolulu to do live performances on the Internet for audiences in Japan.⁶⁸ Due to more restrictive laws concerning pornography in Japan, the men decided to operate their Web site from Hawaii and broadcast the live shows back to Japan. The Japanese men in Hawaii placed ads in Japan for “nude models.” Upon their arrival in Hawaii, the women were used to make pornography and perform live Internet sex shows. The entire operation was aimed at a Japanese audience. The Web site was written in Japanese. The women performed strip shows by Web cam and responded to requests from men watching in Japan. They used wireless keyboards for live sex chat with the men at a rate of \$1/minute. The Japanese men, operating as Aloha Data, used digital cameras to capture the live video chat, then transmitted it to a server in California run by a “not respectable, but not illegal” ISP called Lucy’s Tiger Den. Japanese viewers accessed the performance through the California server.⁶⁹

The defendants used email to communicate between the smugglers and the women. They discussed how much money they would earn and where to wire the money. The Japanese men envisioned a much larger operation. They were planning on making pornography for Japanese buyers.

This case offers some twists in crime, smuggling/trafficking and new technologies. James Chaparro, Director, Anti-Smuggling and Trafficking Unit, U.S. Immigration and Naturalization Service characterized the case in this way: “The Japanese men violated U.S. immigration law by smuggling/trafficking Japanese women into the U.S. in order to circumvent the Japanese law against pornography.”⁷⁰ Omer Poirier, U.S. Attorney in Honolulu, who handled the case described it this way: “Japanese men were smuggling women into the U.S. from Japan to provide services for men in Japan.”⁷¹

Rape and torture images and videos

Slave Farm is a Web site registered in Denmark that claims it to have the “world’s largest collection of real life amateur slaves.”⁷²

Men are encouraged to “submit a slave to the picture farm.” The images included women being subjected to all types of sexual torture, bondage and fetish sadism. Description of images include: “needle torture,” “hot wax,” “extreme hogtie,” “hanging bondage,” “tits nailed to board,” “drunk from the toilet,” and “pregnant bondage.” Live chat is available where men can “command the bitches.” A number of images are available free, but full access requires payment of a subscription fee. The women are visibly injured. A report to the police of had been done to them would viewed as a violent crime. The Slave Farm Web site also offers an “online slave auction,” where people offer their “slaves” for services. Graphic descriptions of extremely violent acts are included in the advertisement.



A Web site registered in Moscow, Russia advertises itself as “the best and most violent rape site on earth.”⁷³ It claims to have “Several Hunders [sic]of rape pics.” Subscribers are offered 30,000 hardcore porn images, 500 online video channels, and 100 long, high quality videos. There are images and videos of “violent rapes, ass rapes, mouth rapes, gang rapes, nigger rapes, torn vaginas, and tortured clits.” There is a 13 MB video and audio movie available free that can be downloaded in 12 files, each about 1 MB, that shows the rape of a woman in an office by a hooded perpetrator. The

video is so horrific I had to seek emotional support after viewing it and was not able to continue with my research for days.

Previously, few people had access to such extreme material. As one consultant explained, “Formerly men used to have to remove themselves from their community by three levels [to find extreme, violent pornography]. First, they had to go somewhere, physically, then know where to go, and then know how to find it. The Web makes it very easy to get that far removed very quickly.”⁷⁴

Global epidemic of sexual exploitation on the Internet

The epidemic of trafficking for sexual exploitation is widely recognized as a global crisis. The resurgence of child pornography is a priority by law enforcement agencies, resulting in unparalleled international cooperation to break up the rings. In contrast, the pornography of adults and post adolescent teens has been completely ignored. In U.S. and Europe few, if any, cases against the producers or distributors of even the worst images are prosecuted.

A lot of the pornography is extremely misogynistic, with women portrayed as seeking and enjoying every type of humiliation, degradation, and painful sex act imaginable. Women and children are harmed physically, sexually and emotionally in the making of pornography.⁷⁵ Although, we have less information or cases, it is likely that many women are coerced into making pornography just as they are coerced into prostitution. It seems as if perpetrators can commit any sexual crime against a woman or post adolescent teen and get away with it—as long as they photograph or record it, call it pornography, and put it on the Internet.

In doing my research, each time I surf around the Web, I find the percentage of degrading, violent, misogynistic pornography is increasing, and the torture and bestiality images and videos are becoming more readily available. New technologies are a factor. I don't believe there is anything new in the content of pornography. Perpetrators have always raped and tortured women and children in the making of pornography. What is new is volume of pornography that is being made and that the average person with a computer, modem and search engine can find thousands of violent, degrading images within minutes that 15 years ago they would never have found in a lifetime. The increase in video clips with audio and streaming video makes the action and harm come alive. New techniques, such as shockwave flash movies, enable the creation of animated videos. Skilled amateurs can create snuff films for distribution on the Web. One person I interviewed said, “With virtual film, it is possible to produce a snuff film from animation, but very difficult to tell it is not real. Now, we are limited only by our imaginations. There is nothing that can't happen on the Web.”⁷⁶

Sexual exploitation of women on the Internet is an extreme crisis for women's status, rights and dignity in the global community. Policy decisions, technological innovations and inter-related psychological phenomena have converged to create this crisis. First, those with the authority to prosecute perpetrators no longer consider making and distributing even the most sexually violent pornographic images of women a crime. In the U.S., the largest producer of pornography in the world, there have been no Federal prosecutions of obscenity for eight years.⁷⁷ Second, the Internet has made massive numbers and kinds of pornographic images easily available. In 1997, there were approximately 22,000 Web sites with free pornographic content, by 2000 that number had risen to 280,000.⁷⁸ In the UK, there was a five fold increased in child pornography from 215 cases in 1997 to 1128 in 1999.⁷⁹ Third, the Internet lowers sexual inhibitions of users by normalizing the images and behaviors, and providing a virtual support community for users online. Some users find that the risk of downloading illegal images adds to the excitement.⁸⁰ There is also evidence that images viewed on

the Internet increase the amount of sexual activity. Offenders interviewed by the COPINE Project described trying to maintain a continuous state of arousal and masturbation the entire time they were online, often to the point of being painful.⁸¹

How should one begin to analyze such a crisis? Legal standards do not exist anymore. At first it seems as if, at least, a line has been drawn at child pornography, but only pornography of pre-pubescent and early adolescent children has been prosecuted. Law enforcement officials cite the difficulty in determining the age of post-adolescent teens in still images and videos, so no action is taken against them.

The COPINE Project in Ireland in their analysis of collectors and producers of child pornography has decided that victimization is the key place to start. “[E]ach time a picture is assessed for sexual purposes it victimizes the individual concerned.”⁸² In referring to a child pornography collection the researchers say, “In a sense, the function of picture collections for the offender is to repeatedly victimize the child concerned, and the victim status is exaggerated by continued use. ... an important purpose of child picture collections for the user is that it allows instant access to the child as victim.”⁸³ Years ago, anti-pornography activist Andrea Dworkin said the same thing about the “technologized prostitution” of pornographic videos, in which the victim can be sold over and over again.⁸⁴

Although there are legal standards for child pornography, child pornography collectors have many images they collect for sexual purposes that do not meet the legal standard. Max Taylor of the COPINE Project realized the importance of analyzing these images for their meaning to the offender, their place in his collection and his victimization of children in the images.⁸⁵ The images can then be placed on a continuum of increased deliberate sexual victimization. Through this type of analysis the researchers hope to arrive at an understanding of the factors that enable and sustain offender behavior.⁸⁶ This type of approach and analysis may reveal the goal of producers and users of pornography and the role it plays in creating and maintaining inequality between women and men.

Facilitation of Access to Pornography

One of the ongoing debates between the Internet industry, law enforcement and the public is how much responsibility service providers bear for the content on their servers or within their control.

Landslide Verification Service

In 2000, a couple in Fort Worth, Texas was arrested for providing access to several child pornography sites. The Reedys ran an online adult verification service for sex industry sites on the Web. After verifying a person’s credit card and their age, they assigned users passwords, which gave the users access to other Webmaster’s sex industry sites, including child pornography sites. Although there were many sites worldwide, only three foreign Webmasters were charged – two in Indonesia and one in Russia.⁸⁷ (The Indonesians and Russian were not apprehended.) Each site charged a monthly subscription fee ranging from US\$14.95 to US\$29.95. Reedy’s company, Landslide, provided more than 300,000 users access to 5,700 sex industry sites.⁸⁸ About 30-40 percent of their income came from web sites with child pornography. The Reedys kept 40 percent of the money from the subscription fees, netting them more than US\$1,000,000 between 1997 and 1999.⁸⁹ Subscribers also got access to bulletin boards where pedophiles traded passwords for access to other child pornography sites where people offered or sought children for purposes of sexual abuse.⁹⁰

Email messages between Reedy and the child pornography Webmasters were used in the trial as evidence of Reedy's knowledge of the child pornography content of the Web sites. Adding a personal perspective on the harm to children used in the production of child pornography, a detective from the National Crime Squad in London testified that she knew two of the children in some of the pornography distributed on the Web sites. The children had been sexually abused and filmed by their stepfather in Manchester, UK.⁹¹

Although the Reedys claimed they didn't know the contents of the Webmaster's sites, they were found guilty of 87 counts of sexually exploiting minors, distributing child pornography and conspiracy.⁹²

Internet service provider guilty of knowingly providing access to child pornography

In February 2001, in what was called a "groundbreaking case," an Internet service provider (ISP) in the U.S. pleaded guilty to a charge of criminal facilitation for knowingly providing subscribers with access to child pornography through a newsgroup. Although the case was the first of its kind in the U.S., the New York State Attorney General said:

*"This case establishes a common sense standard for the Internet. When an ISP becomes aware of illegal child pornography available in its system, the ISP cannot put its head in the sand."*⁹³

The investigation was initiated two years ago, following the successful prosecution of members of Pedo University, a child pornography ring with members in U.S., Canada, Sweden and New Zealand. After dismantling the child pornography ring, the investigators turned their attention from the users of the newsgroup to the ISP that provided access to the newsgroup. Alt.binaries.erotica.preteen published graphic images of child sexual abuse, and a 40 page long FAQ (Frequently Asked Questions) on what the group was about, what images they could/should send and how to hide their identity, such as spoofing a header and using anonymous re-mailers.⁹⁴

Buffnet, the ISP in West Seneca, New York, took no action to remove the newsgroup after being notified by a customer and the police that child pornography was available there. The ISP also tried to quash almost a dozen subpoenas in the previous Pedo University case. It refused to take action to remove the newsgroup even after police showed them graphic images, such as the rape of a four-year-old.

This case may set an important precedent for holding Internet service providers accountable for the material they knowingly transmit.

The Users

This section will describe *who* the different groups of users of the new communication and information technologies are.

Internet Usage Statistics in Europe

Many of the new communications and information technologies are part of the Internet. Access and use of the Internet is not evenly distributed across the states of the Council of Europe (See Table 1). Not surprising, the wealthiest Western European States have the highest percentages of their populations using the Internet, and the poorest Eastern and South Central European States have the lowest. In three countries--Iceland, Norway and Sweden--over 50 percent of the population is online. The largest in total number of users are the UK, Germany and Italy. In contrast, in the poorest countries, less than one percent of the population uses the Internet--Albania, Belarus, Bosnia, Moldova, and Ukraine.

Table 1

Internet Usage Statistics from European Countries ^a

Country	Number	Percent	Country	Number	Percent
Albania	2500	0.07	Latvia	234,000	9.73
Andorra	5000	7.48	Lithuania	225,000	6.20
Austria	3,000,000	36.9	Luxembourg	95,000	21.72
Belarus	10,000	0.10	Macedonia	30,000	1.47
Belgium	2,700,000	26.36	Malta	40,000	10.21
Bosnia	3500	0.09	Moldova	15,000	0.34
Bulgaria	200,000	2.57	Netherlands	7,280,000	45.82
Croatia	100,000	2.14	Norway	2,360,000	52.60
Cyprus	80,000	10.55	Poland	2,800,000	7.25
Czech Rep.	350,000	3.40	Portugal	700,000	6.97
Denmark	2,580,000	48.37	Romania	600,000	2.68
Estonia	309,000	21.59	Russia	9,200,000	6.30
Faroe Is.	3000	6.62	Slovak Rep.	700,000	12.94
Finland	2,270,000	43.93	Slovenia	460,000	23.00
France	9,000,000	15.26	Spain	5,490,000	13.72
Germany	20,100,000	24.28	Sweden	5,000,000	56.36
Greece	1,330,000	12.42	Switzerland	2,400,000	33.05
Hungary	650,000	6.38	Turkey	2,000,000	3.05
Iceland	144,000	52.11	Ukraine	200,000	0.41
Ireland	1,040,000	27.50	United Kingdom	19,980,000	33.58
Italy	13,420,000	23.29	Yugoslavia	80,000	-

^a All numbers from 2000

Source: NUA Internet Surveys

The Collectors

Due to law enforcement actions against collectors, distributors and producers of child pornography, followed by analysis of the collections and collectors/distributors/producers, these perpetrators are beginning to be characterized to better understand their behaviors and the role communication and information technologies play in the sexual exploitation.

At this time, the analysis of collectors has been limited to collectors of child pornography. It is known that some people have large collections of adult pornography. The specifics of the volume of their collections has sometime become public after their collections were discovered on work computers. Probably, many of the distributors of pornography on the Internet started off as collectors, then decided to make money from their collections.

Collectors of child pornography and the role of the Internet

Through the analysis of its database of child pornography, the COPINE Project found that the majority of children used in the making of pornography are white, with fewer being Asian, and almost none being black. The analysis of images on child pornography newsgroups indicates that the average age of the children, especially the girls, is getting younger, and more images are being made of children from Eastern Europe.⁹⁵

The COPINE Project conducted interviews with those who downloaded and/or distributed and/or produced child pornography, and/or sexually assaulted a child. They found that people who use the Internet to download pornography are progressive in their offending behavior that is directly related to their level of use of the Internet.

Offenders are people who have had early sexual behavior (probably sexually abused themselves), have poor adult social skills, and are dissatisfied with their present selves. Acquiring a computer and computer skills enables them to enter a world where they can get satisfaction from images and fantasy and meet a virtual community of people who reinforce their behavior. They may develop a sense of confidence in themselves for their new computer skills and success at building a large collection. Often, their collections took up more and more of their time as they sorted and cataloged the images they downloaded and traded.⁹⁶

Most start out accessing adult pornography, then move on to child pornography. They continually move up to more sophisticated technologies and more sexual exploitation of children, either in seeking more harmful, extreme images, or the physical sexual abuse of children.

Collecting is an important psychological process and is directly connected to acquiring new technological skills. The offender becomes increasingly “empowered” by the combination of a physical collection, sexual satisfaction, computer skills and a supportive online community.

“The rapid acquisition of images largely goes hand-in-hand with the acquisition of technical skills. Collecting also leads to an increase in fantasy and sexual activity, particularly masturbation in relation to images or through engaging in mutual fantasies with others while online. With increasing mastery of the Internet comes a sense of power and control.”⁹⁷

The COPINE Project found that those who collect child pornography through the Internet have many similarities with other child sex offenders. In addition, they had varying degrees of “function addition,” resulting in mood modification, tolerance, withdrawal symptoms, conflict and relapse.⁹⁸

Collectors of male child pornography

During a three-year Internet law enforcement project, conducted by the Keene Police Department, New Hampshire, USA, which focused on the sexual abuse of boys, 200 offenders were arrested. Of the 200 offenders, 143 were “collectors” of child pornography of boys. They ranged in age from 13- to 65-years-old. Collectors and distributors, one as young as 14 years old, operated trading centers from their computers. The size of the collections ranged from a few hundred images to tens of thousands (one man had 43,000 image files). Collectors needed large computer storage, such as extra hard drives, zip and jazz disks, and CD ROMS, to store all their images and videos. Some collectors used other people’s computers, such as the high school teacher arrested in Indiana, USA who had his collection on the high school mainframe computer.⁹⁹ Others stored their collections in cyber space, meaning they have access, either legally or illegally, to storage on servers or even private computers and connect to them through the Internet.

McLaughlin of the Keene Police Department considered the collectors to be entry-level offenders. Most of them had no prior contact with law enforcement, and were not known to have sexually abused a child. The majority of the collectors were single, lived alone and socially isolated. Twenty one percent of them were in occupations or vocations that brought them into contact with children.¹⁰⁰

Many of the collectors started off collecting still images of children from newsgroups and Web pages that did not involve online interaction with others. Some then escalated to interacting with others in chat rooms. They also moved from collecting still images to video clips. Following that some started to distribute child pornography. When the collectors interacted with other collectors they use their collections as currency to trade with other collectors, thereby moving from collectors to distributors. The men traded their collections by categories that described the type of images (poses, nudist, action, bareback), the racial/ethnic identity of the victims (Euros, Indians, Asians, etc), physical descriptions of the boys--circumcised or not (cut versus uncut), color of hair and eyes, and who the child is being abused by--another boy, an adult.¹⁰¹

Collectors become deeply involved with their collections, spending enormous amounts of time memorizing hundreds, even thousands, of images, file names, and photographic series. They know if they have seen an image before and if it was renamed. Offenders frequently print out hard copies of the favorite images and keep them in their bedrooms for masturbation purposes.¹⁰²

*“Massive child pornography collections with as many as 40,000 image files have been seized. These image files are divided and subdivided many times into folders according to age, hair color, sex acts portrayed and many other categories. Some of these categories are very specific such as grouping prepubertal male children who are only wearing socks, to circumcised pubescent children shown in bedroom settings. The amount of time it takes to download one picture, view it and place it in a file folder, multiplied by the size of the collection demonstrates the large investment of time these behaviors represent”*¹⁰³

Many of the child pornography collectors would never have engaged in this activity, certainly not to the extent they did, if not for the new communications and information technologies that were available to them. The technology didn’t cause their interest or activity, but it played a heavy role in facilitating it.

The Stalkers

The Internet has become a favored site for stalking children. Sex offender can engage children on many levels, from sexual talk to enticing them into meeting them. The many ways of disguising a

person's identity has allowed many child sex stalkers to commit sex crimes against children with impunity. In 1995, the North American Boy Love Association, an organization that defends pedophilia as a type of "love" for boys, published an article entitled "Man/Boy Love on the Internet". The article gave details on how to use the Internet to contact children.¹⁰⁴

Online stalkers may themselves be adolescents. In 1998, Home Office research found that adolescent sex offenders accounted for one third of all sex crime in the UK.¹⁰⁵ And a recent study by the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children in the U.S. found that half of online solicitations involved juvenile offenders.¹⁰⁶ It should be noted that these juvenile stalkers are themselves most likely previously or presently being sexually abused.

During a three year Internet law enforcement project conducted by the Keene Police Department, New Hampshire, USA, 200 offenders were arrested who targeted male children. (In this project, police officers entered chat rooms and newsgroups pretending to be boys.) Forty-eight of those men were "travelers," meaning they stalked boys online and eventually tried to meet them. They ranged in age from 17 to 56, with a mean age of 35, and the following age distribution: 17 to 29 (38%), 30s (25%), 40s (27%), and 50s (10%). Most, but not all, of these stalkers collected child pornography. Four of the men traveled internationally from Canada, Holland and Norway, and the others traveled from 10 different states in the U.S.. A few of the stalkers sent money, bus or airline tickets for the boys to use to run away and meet them.

Over half of the 48 men originally told boys that they were in their teens, then later revealed that they were older, although none gave their real (older) age. Over half of the 48 sent photographs, often naked, of themselves. The online conversations were aimed at building trust, engaging in sexual talk and sending pornographic images.

On one stalker's computer police found 25 transcripts of chats he had with boys from age 12 to 15 in five different states. He had convinced the boys to give him their names, addresses, directions to their homes, and cover stories to protect him.

When the offender arrived to meet the boys (really the police), they had condoms, lubricants, photography equipment and other supplies.

Although sadistic pedophiles are thought to be about 1 percent of all child sex offenders, three of the 48 men in the group were sadists. One stalker participated in a child torture chat room. When another offender's house was searched police found photographs of dead children in shallow graves. Another stalker was already in police custody for the murder of a child.

The stalking of children on the Internet is receiving increasing attention and action from governments and law enforcement, but McLaughlin, Keene Police Department, New Hampshire, USA believes that less than one percent of those committing crimes on the Internet are being apprehended.¹⁰⁷

The Buyers

Men who buy women and children in prostitution post information about their experiences in newsgroups and on the Web. They often reveal a lot about themselves: who they are, their attitudes toward women, and how they treat women.

Within the men's descriptions of their buying experiences are many hints of their use of trafficked women.

"the girls are more and more from Eastern European countries, and they are often illegal in Austria."
November 95, Vienna, Austria

In Bulgaria - 80% are from Bulgaria, 20% from Russia, Ukraina or Belorussia. Normally the girls have their pimps who are not hesitating to contact you and negotiating the price. – German in Bulgaria

Around the railway station are exactly 13 sex malls. In each of them are working 20 to 80 girls. More than 90 % of them are foreigners. Mostly Spanish speaking from the Caribbean Islands, Colombia, Venezuela and Brazil. The second largest ethnic group far behind Latin and South American are Thai, and the Asians are all Thai, even if they tell something different. On third are German and African girls. It has changed in the last years, Thai and African girls used to be more. The African girls, by the way not every black girl is African, some are also South American. You can hear it from their accent. Around the "Breite Gasse" are only Spanish speaking girls – 2000, Frankfurt, Germany

Aarhus is a second rate town in terms of prostitution. Down-at-their-heels women who often seem to be deportees from the Third World, depressive airs, and rudimentary English capabilities is the norm. 1999, Aarhus, Denmark

Helsinki, Finland - Russian prostitutes have 'taken over' restaurant " _____"; public disturbances with Russian guys fistfighting over some particular woman; October 97, Helsinki, Finland

two Romanian girls, and another time when I was invited to the dancing troupe's (7 Dominican Republic girls) apartment. The women that work in the nightclubs can be from anywhere. Most of them are on contracts from "modelling agencies" in poor countries. Predominant were the former Soviet Union, Thailand, Philippines, and the Dominican Republic. There are a lot of Greek girls too though. They usually travel a lot, especially the ones on contract. The contract girls will also go to many of the Arab countries and some of their customers will follow them back to Greece. Many of the contract girls are looking for husbands too, so if you're that type of guy, it's fairly easy to take advantage of them with promises. 1995, Greece

The men who use the Internet to find women for prostitution (and then write about their experiences there) seem to be mostly traveling businessmen, local men reporting on local prostitution, or students. Some of them say they consult newsgroups or Web sites before they travel and even print out the information to take with them. The following are some examples:

In the last 5 years I have been traveling to Vienna 4-5 times per year, and I thought to share my experience concerning sex services and more specifically the escort services. 19 Aug 1995, Vienna, Austria

I am writing you from Germany. I am travelling frequently through Bulgaria so I can give you a certain survey about the sexual situation.

I always travel to Budapest for my job, so I really can say how the sex scene has changed in the last 7/8 years. 1998, Budapest, Hungary

I've noticed that your fine site does not include any info on Lyon, France. So, being there for almost four weeks on some business, I had the pleasure, with the help of some locals, to experience some night activities. 2000, Lyon, France

I was living in Prague for 2 1/2 years. In my time there I visited most of the Men's Clubs in that fine town. Jan 97, Prague, Czech Republic

Well I have lived in London all my life and can give you guys a few tips on the current situation. 2000, London, UK

I'm going to be studying in Paris this spring, and am interested in studying more than just astronomy and French...can anyone give me some ideas of where I could find services in Paris? Thanks!

Aarhus is the second largest town in Denmark, ...and so far neglected by the World Sex Guide. So, being a bright young student of ethnography, I set out on a research tour in my own university town in

order to update my knowledge (and yours) on the big issues: Where? And how much? 1999, Aarhus, Denmark

Some of the men write about their experiences buying women in prostitution as a way of reliving the experience. One man wrote, "I'm getting a hard-on as I remember this night to write about it." Some men include a lot of graphic details that indicate they are getting enjoyment out of reliving the experience through writing about it.

Links between prostitution and pornography

Prostitution and pornography are often treated as if they are separate phenomenon, when they are much the same. Women in prostitution frequently make pornography, and men who buy women in prostitution often take photographs or videos. Also, as a "porn star's" usually short-lived career ends, she often moves into prostitution. The following man's description of his experience in Copenhagen, Denmark includes the making of pornography.

"_____ Services offering traditional escort services either at their place or at your hotel, or a chance to take/make photographs or videos of you in action with one or more of the girls. They have full video equipment at their premises. Prices for video services start from 1000 Danish Kronor for 30 minutes with one girl, including a strip, vibrator action and to finish, a hand job with a condom. For 3000 Kronor you get 30 minutes with one girl with a bit of everything - oral, straight sex and anal. I chose _____ - a perfect young body with a hint of puppy fat, and an amazingly tight pussy. The only fault was that she was so cool and unresponsive throughout. That apart, great value and the video of our fuck is still a prized possession." 2000, Copenhagen, Denmark

In the U.S. there is a Web site called "Streetwalkerspic.com" where a man goes out looking for women in prostitution on the street in Tennessee, then takes them to a hotel room where he photographs them. The images are then posted on a Web site with descriptions of them. At first the images were free, but he has turned the site into a pay site, with subscription fees.

The Producers

The producers of child pornography and adult pornography are viewed and treated entirely differently in Europe and the U.S. One is viewed as the worst type of perpetrator of violence, while the other is seen as a film producer and businessperson.

Producers of child pornography

Most child pornography on the Internet is U.S. generated. According to Bruce Taylor, who formerly worked at the U.S. Department of Justice's Child Exploitation and Obscenity Unit, now Director of the National Law Center for Children and Families, "U.S. has more men on the Internet and more men making and using child pornography. We are still the leaders."¹⁰⁸

During a three year Internet law enforcement project conducted by the Keene Police Department, New Hampshire, USA, 200 offenders were arrested who targeted male children. Of the 200 offenders they arrested, eight were producers of child pornography. They found that not all collectors of child pornography are producers but all producers are collectors. These eight offenders ranged in age from 26 to 53 with a average age of 41.

Sex offenders sent digital cameras to their contacts they thought were boys for them to connect them to their computers and send live sex acts to the men. The men planned to use video capture equipment to record the images and movies for later distribution. Offenders were also involved in secretly photographing children in public places or while asleep. They used hidden cameras in public

bathrooms to capture images of children. Many of the offenders were still distributing images of children they had sexually abused years ago.

Most of the producers of child pornography were actively sexually abusing children or had criminal histories of sex offenses with children. In four of the producer cases, runaway children were found in the homes of the offenders. The men engaged in many fetishes and paraphilias, as well. Only one man had made any money from the sale of child pornography over the Internet, and that was under US\$1000.

The producers of child pornography were also more likely to be involved in other criminal activity. Police searches found offenders to have committed other crimes, such as: homicide, possession of explosives, controlled substance distribution and possession, firearms violations and the harboring of runaways.¹⁰⁹

Eastern European countries, in particularly, Russia, have become center for the production of child pornography. "In many parts of Eastern Europe and Russia, 'anything goes,' as long as you pay a share of your profits to the 'mafia.'" Another factor making Eastern Europe a popular site for the production of child pornography is that the Slavic children are popular among collectors who prefer white children.¹¹⁰

In Budapest, Hungary, now known as the pornography production capital of Europe, there have been reports of young children--usually homeless or neglected-- being recruited for pornography with promises of glamorous careers in modeling. In the town of Eger in northern Hungary, a man was arrested in June 1996 for using girls between the ages of 10 and 15 in his pornographic videos. He faced charges not for making the films, but for appearing in them. Under Hungarian law, children over the age of 14 can give "partial consent." This means a pornographic video produced with two 15-year-olds is not illegal, but a video of an adult having sex with a 15-year-old is. Moreover, in 1996, Hungary had no laws against the possession or distribution of child pornography. This lack of legislation provided child pornographers with attractive legal loopholes.¹¹¹

Producers of adult pornography

Almost all sex industry companies are moving into new media venues, such as preparing for Internet broadband, and interactive hotel-room TV.¹¹² Adult pornography production is moving from the control of organized crime groups to big business in U.S. and Europe. For several years, there has been a push on all fronts internationally to normalize and legitimize prostitution and pornography.

The U.S. is the largest pornography producer in the world. In California where most of the production facilities are located the pornography industry claims to employ 20,000 people, and pay US\$31 million in state sales tax on video sales, alone.¹¹³ In 2000, there were 11,000 pornographic videos produced in the U.S..¹¹⁴ The online sex industry generated US\$1.8 billion in revenue in 2000.¹¹⁵

Beyond the big money numbers, statistics on availability and demand for pornography on the Internet are becoming harder to find. Previously, there were statistics on the proportions of Web searches that were for pornography, the proportion of advertising revenue that came from the sex sites, etc. In the last year or two those statistics have disappeared. When I called the ratings and Internet research companies I was told that they no longer separated out statistics by "adult entertainment," at least those they are making publicly available. The "adult entertainment" numbers are now included in the "entertainment" or "advertisement" statistics. I believe that publishing statistics relating to the online sex industry was causing negative publicity for the Internet industries and the large corporations who

have a stake in the sex and Internet industries. Therefore, a decision was made to no longer collect information specific to searches for pornography, etc, or not make it public. There were a few online marketing reports for the sex industry businesses, including for European markets, each available for US\$2000-US\$2500.

Just because adult pornography is generating billions of dollars and big businesses have entered the market doesn't mean that the production standards of pornography have changed, especially for the women used in the videos. According to one producer:

“[A]nyone with a video camera can be a director – there are countless bottom feeders selling nasty loops on used tape. Whatever the quality or origin of a product, it can at the very least be exhibited on one of the 70,000 adult pay Web sites, about a quarter of which are owned by a few privately held companies that slice and dice the same content under different brands.”¹¹⁶

As a result of the huge market on the Web for pornography and the competition among sites, the Internet images have become even rougher, more violent and degrading. One producer claimed that there were “no coerced” performances in pornography videos, although she immediately acknowledged that “there are little pipsqueaks who get their disgusting little videos out there. There’s a trend in misogynistic porn, and it’s upsetting.”¹¹⁷ She went on to say, “I’ve been in the business for more than 20 years, and I helped make it possible for these guys to make these kinds of movies.”¹¹⁸

It has become popular to say that, “There is no safer sex than porn.”¹¹⁹ That might be true for the user of the pornography, but most certainly isn’t true for the women being used in the making of it.

Budapest – Pornography production capital

Budapest, also referred to as “Budalsex” and “Budaporn,” has become of one Europe’s pornography production capitals.¹²⁰ American and European pornography producers have moved to Budapest, Hungary because of the cheap, available actors from Eastern and Central Europe. Budapest provides low production costs, lax government regulations and attitudes, and beautiful scenery. There are hundreds of pornography films produced each year in Budapest. In only eight years, Budapest has become probably the biggest center for pornography production in Europe, eclipsing rivals such as Amsterdam and Copenhagen.¹²¹ Hungarian filmmaker, Istvan Kovacs produced the first all-Hungarian pornographic video. From 1992-1997, he directed more than 30 feature length pornographic films.¹²²

The production of pornography in Budapest is defended as part of its new free market economy. András Török, former Deputy Minister of Culture, said, “Pornography is an industry for Hungary, not a tragedy.”¹²³

Pornography producers have been given unprecedented access to public and official sites to make their videos. Patrick Collins, owner of Elegant Angel, was the first American pornography director to film in Budapest. The first movie he directed, *Buttwoman Does Budapest*, included a scene that was filmed on the city’s busiest tram in the middle of the day. The scene was of a couple having sex in a public streetcar, while another woman masturbated in an adjoining streetcar. The tram traveled its normal route through a residential area, pausing at regular stops where people waiting for the tram witnessed the production. He claimed he was able to do this by bribing the streetcar controller with US\$100 and a box of chocolates.¹²⁴ An Italian pornography producer, Steve Morelli, has filmed ten movies in Budapest. One of his latest videos, *Thighs Wide Shut*, was produced in the velvet-upholstered mahogany-paneled library of a government ministry.¹²⁵ In 2000, the Minister of

Education ordered an investigation after a German hard-core pornography producer used a prestigious high school for its main set.¹²⁶

Most West European producers of sex videos use East European actors wherever possible. “They cost less and do more,” an executive at Germany's Silwa production company explains, bluntly.¹²⁷

Budapest is a destination and transit city for women trafficked from Ukraine, Moldova, Russia Romania, and Yugoslavia. In Budapest, the women are trained for prostitution and issued fake documents before being sent to countries in Western Europe.¹²⁸

In 2000, police uncovered a trafficking ring in Zuglo District of Budapest. An Austrian citizen, Valter Primus, organized a large trafficking, prostitution ring. The women were recruited from Kiev, Bucharest and Belgrade through advertisements in newspapers offering work as dancers in the West. When the women arrived in Budapest they were forced into prostitution and sent to Austria, Germany and Belgium. The network had branches in Ukraine, Serbia and Romania with people assigned to specific tasks, such as organizer, guard, driver, and drug-dealer. In several months time 300 women were trafficked to through Budapest.¹²⁹

Although the trafficking of women for prostitution into and through Budapest is widely recognized as a serious problem controlled by organized crime, no one I communicated with knew anything about trafficking for pornography production, or the connection between prostitution and pornography.

The Consumers

Little is known about the average consumer of Internet pornography and live Webcasts. More specific information about “markets” for “adult entertainment” have been compiled by Internet research and marketing companies for sale to sex industry companies. The information gathered about workplace use of pornography is probably the source of data there is about the general audience for adult pornography. There seems to be broad use of the Internet by many people to access pornography, with a sharp skewed distribution toward a minority of men who have developed an obsession and spend hundreds of hours downloading thousands of images.

Researchers at the COPINE Project in Ireland made the following observation about the lack of information about consumers of pornography. In this case, the authors were referring to child pornography collectors:

“A major weakness in contemporary work in this area is that it does not consider how individual consumers use and understand pornographic or other photographic media nor does it acknowledge their choice, responsibility and accountability for their behaviors. A particular absence in the literature is any attempt to understand the nature of photographs of children, or their significance for the user.”¹³⁰

James McLaughlin, Keene Police Department, New Hampshire, USA, made a similar comment, once again in regard to child sex offenders who use the Internet.

“Presently there is no profile for people who go on to the Internet and seek out child pornography, sexual contacts with children or who want to engage in cybersex with children. At this time there is not enough data collected to determine if there is any difference between those who engage in the sexual abuse/exploitation of children in traditional ways as compared to those who employ computer technology to do so.”¹³¹

Many might argue that an adult using adult pornography is not at all the same as an adult using child pornography. Discussing aspects of that topic are beyond the scope of this report, but I do not think

that in consideration of issues related to equality between women and men, the use of pornography can be ignored or dismissed as meaningless.

Workplace Users

There is considerable information about pornography in the workplace, not because employers or unions are concerned about the sexual exploitation of women and children, but because they are concerned about lost productivity and liability for allowing a hostile work environment. Most employers are concerned about all non-work related use of the Internet by employees. Surveys of employees and analyses of businesses' Internet transmission logs reveal that images of sexual exploitation are pervasive in the workplace.

A Vault.com survey of 1200 employees in 1999, found that 90 percent of employees said they surfed non-work-related sites during the workday.¹³² In 2001, a WebSense survey of 800 employees in the UK, Italy, France and Germany found that 41 percent of employees admit to personal surfing of the Web for more than three hours per week during company time.¹³³

In 1997, Novell commissioned a survey of pornography in the workplace in the UK. The study found that 23 percent men surveyed said they knew someone at their workplace that used the Internet to access pornography or anti-social material. In 2000, Websense estimated that 20 percent of workers access pornography sites at work.¹³⁴

According to a survey of 1000 Internet users conducted by Greenfield Online NetPulse, men are 20 times more likely than women to download pornography while at work, and employees earning US\$75,000 to US\$100,000 annually are more than twice as likely to download pornography as those making less than US\$35,000.¹³⁵

A U.S. computer consultant who analyzes transmission logs for companies concerned about employees non-work related use of the Internet said that 30 percent of men and three percent of women use the Web to look for pornography while in the workplace. He said he found cases where after hours or on a weekend employees had accessed pornography for 3 hours at a time. When asked to characterize these workplace users, he said they were a hard group to characterize. "A lot of them are late teens, early twenties, but there isn't really an age group that predominates." He did see a correlation between surfing for pornography and surfing for other hobby related information as well.¹³⁶

Statistics from the sex industry reveal even more work place pornography access than people were willing to admit on employee surveys. According to *SexTracker*, pornography sites are accessed more than 27 million times per day, with the top sites being accesses 2.8 million times per day. Seventy percent of all Internet pornography traffic occurs during the 9-to-5 workday. *Playboy.com* is accessed more often during business hours than after work.

The amount of time spent and the number of images downloaded by some men can be staggering. In 1998, Aker Martime in UK discovered that 20 percent of employees time on the Internet was spent accessing pornography.¹³⁷ In 1998, a scientist employed by the Defence Evaluation and Research Agency (UK), was suspended after 170,000 pornographic images, some featuring sex with children and animals, were found on his computer. The computer was reserved for exchange of scientists around the world, resulting in 3,500 staff members having access to the pornographic material. Seventy percent of the time it was online it was used for accessing pornography.¹³⁸

Downloading pornography in the workplace has resulted in a number of employees being fired in the U.S. and Europe. A 2001 Websense survey found that about 11 percent of companies in the UK had fired someone for unauthorized use of the Internet, most of which was related to browsing of pornography.¹³⁹ In 1998, North Sea Oil fired four employees for storing pornography on their work computers.¹⁴⁰ In 1999, Rolls-Royce in UK fired five people for using company computers to send “grossly offensive” hardcore pornography.¹⁴¹ In autumn 2000, Orange PLC – the mobile-phone subsidiary of France Telecom SA fired 32 workers for distributing pornography they downloaded from the Internet.¹⁴²

In the U.S., sixty percent of Fortune 500 companies surveyed by Strategic Surveys Intl. had disciplined or fired employees because of misuse of the Internet.¹⁴³ In 2000, the *New York Times* fired 22 workers, Xerox Corporation fired 40, and Compaq Corporation fired 20, for accessing and distributing “off-color” jokes, violent material and pornographic images, and surfing for pornography on company time. Those fired from Compaq had logged onto pornography sites at least 1000 times while at work. Some of those fired from Xerox spent up to eight hours per day on X-rated sites.¹⁴⁴ A number of employees at IBM, ATT&T, Apple, NASA and Hewlett-Packard visited the Penthouse Web site thousands of times a month.¹⁴⁵ In the U.S., Dow Chemical Co. fired 50 workers and suspended another 200 for up to four weeks without pay for sending and storing pornographic or violent e-mail messages. The Dow Chemical Company case was the first in the U.S. to involve blue-collar workers who accessed the material from factory floor computer terminals.¹⁴⁶

A 1998 survey of the online use by the Canadian Department of Fisheries and Oceans, obtained using Canada’s Access to Information Act, revealed that of the 10,000 employees, on average, each one visited a sex-related site seven times per day. During one week, employees visited sex-related sites 70,000 times per day. The most popular site during one week was the live Webcast featuring teenage girls, *Liveteen.com* with the “horniest teens on the Net!”¹⁴⁷

Use of work computers to access pornography is not limited to average employees. In 2000, a number of high-ranking U.S. government employees were caught downloading and storing pornography on their work computers. In the U.S. Commerce Department the security official in charge of personnel background checks was suspended for downloading and storing a “monolithic” collection of pornography on this personal computer and the office intranet. He created files with pictures of women working for him and juxtaposed them with pornographic materials he downloaded from the Internet. Previously, there were complaints of sexual harassment against him, including from a 17-year-old intern, which were never acted upon. Several senior officials at the U.S. Housing and Urban Development Department were suspended after FBI agents discovered they downloaded pornography using their work computers. And dozens of White House staffers, including some senior officials, were caught downloading real-time videos of hard-core pornography, including bestiality and sex with teens. None were fired. One of the worst offenders was a senior staff member who was allowed to keep his job by saying he had a “pornography addiction.”¹⁴⁸ Later in the year, the CIA reported that it was investigating 160 employees and contract workers for exchanging “inappropriate” and “off-color” messages in a covert chat-room. Several CIA officials, including members of the high-echelon Senior Executive Service were involved. They were suspended with pay for six months.¹⁴⁹

These incidences are not only shocking for the job positions of people involved, but it reveals an attitude toward sexually exploitative material that will most likely be reflected in policies concerning sexual exploitation, pornography and the sex industry. Possibly to avoid embarrassing incidents, in

March 2001, the Hungarian parliament installed filters on their computers to prevent the downloading of pornography.¹⁵⁰

New technologies, such as streaming video, which can be accessed with high-speed Internet connections in the office, are likely to draw employee's attention.¹⁵¹ In the U.S., only 6 percent of home users have high speed access that enables streaming video, therefore people are more likely to use these features at work. For example, in May 2000, Victoria's Secret broadcast a 44-minute streaming video fashion show in the middle of the day drawing an audience of 2 million.¹⁵²

Although employers are concerned about loss of productivity and liability, the pervasiveness of pornography in the workplace through Internet access, raises concern for women's equality in the workplace. How are women likely to be viewed and treated if their male colleagues are engaging in so much work time using pornography.

The Unintended Users

There are millions of unintended users of sexually exploitative materials on the Internet. Pornographic material is so pervasive in all forums on the Internet that it is difficult to avoid it. One computer consultant said:

*"There is no practical way to avoid discovering some of this material. You stumble on it by accident. You can hit one of these sites by accident. Boys do things, then they grow out of it. With the Internet, there is no growing out of it. It is always there, all the time."*¹⁵³

The sex industry uses very aggressive techniques to get and keep pornographic material in front of user's eyes. Techniques such as page jacking and mouse trapping were discussed earlier in this report. Spam--unsolicited email--advertising the sex industry lands in almost everyones email inbox. In a Websence survey, one half of employees surveyed say they receive pornographic, sexist or racist emails at work.¹⁵⁴ A woman who worked in my office told me that she always had to be with her young son when he logged onto his email account to delete the pornographic spams. There were usually several a day.

The sex industry is using new "push" technologies to market their products and services to everyone using the Internet. Robert Flores, formerly Deputy Director of Child Exploitation and Obscenity Unit, U.S. Department of Justice, now appointed to head the Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention Program, U.S. Department of Justice, testified before Congress on the aggressive marketing used by the sex industry:

*"The pornography industry has also become among the most aggressive marketers on the Internet, using newly developed "push" technologies alongside offensive and fraudulent marketing ploys. ...the explosive growth in the distribution of obscenity, aggressive marketing efforts ... assault and trap unwilling Web surfers."*¹⁵⁵

Even those whose job it is to prevent misuse of the Internet are forced to look at pornography. Jeff Middleton who analyzes employee use of the Internet in the workplace said this:

*"I hate it when I have to examine proxy logs. I have to spend 4-5 hours browsing sites I would never have gone to find. They probably decided to go look at it because they were bored, but for me someone is paying me not to stop looking."*¹⁵⁶

In the U.S. there has been an ongoing battle about whether the public libraries can install filters to block pornography. Some people argue that children have open access to libraries and should be protected from viewing pornography. Others argue that libraries cannot engage in censorship by

blocking material that the public should be able to access if they want. Librarians have been caught in the middle between irate parents, demanding pornography seekers, and free speech advocates. In some cases librarians have been asked to assist men with their searches for pornography. Courts have decided that in other work settings pornography creates a hostile work environment, and is a form of sexual harassment. In 2000, librarians in Minneapolis, Minnesota, USA, filed a complaint saying that hardcore pornographic Web sites were left visible on vacated terminals, graphic printouts were left on tables and children were observed accessing pornography. Some of the images included bestiality and child molestation. Anyone walking through the library could see pornography on computers.¹⁵⁷ On 24 May 2001, in Minneapolis, Minnesota, USA, the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission ruled in favor of 12 librarians' claim that they had to work in a sexually hostile work environment because of pornography displays on library computers.

The Future User

Teenagers are learning social norms and attitudes, and establishing viewing patterns on the Internet. The sex industry is working to be part of the mix. Pornography is considered just part of the multi-content, multi-media mix.

“..it is ...essential for media companies and advertisers, because teenagers form media habits that will fundamentally influence their adult behaviour. ...the new habits gestating in the bedrooms of Britain’s 4.4m 13 to 17-year-olds will influence the center of gravity of media behaviour for a generation. ... Teenage bedrooms contain a lot of technology. Four out of five 13 to 17- year-olds have an analogue television in their bedroom; more than a third have their own video; almost every bedroom has a radio, too. But the most rapid growth is in interactive media. ... The Internet, too, is invading the bedroom. At least 68 per cent of 13 to 17-year-olds now have access to the Internet at home....almost 10 per cent have an Internet-enabled PC in their own bedroom and this percentage is rapidly rising. Imagine 16-year-old David’s household on Saturday afternoon. ... David has an hour’s private time on the Internet, trading e-mails with his girlfriend, visiting chat rooms, playing multi-player games and surfing a few porn sites....”¹⁵⁸

The largest percentage of users of the Internet is young people. They are forming their opinions and attitudes about sexuality, about norms and acceptable practices. The sex industry knows, just as the tobacco industry does, that getting adolescents hooked is their solid link to success and lack of opposition in the future.

People’s, especially teen’s, attitudes toward women and men, their expected behaviors, roles and rights, are being strongly influenced by the content on the Internet. Considering the misogynistic content of much of the material, it does not bode well for equality between women and men.

The Challenges

Trafficking and sexual exploitation of women and children and use of the Internet to traffic and exploit women and children offer huge and grave challenges to society, from law makers, to law enforcement, to NGOs.¹⁵⁹

Incompatibility of laws among states, and sometimes, even within states, is a challenge. And there is probably no other area with such diversity of, even opposite, policies and practices, as prostitution, pornography, and trafficking of women. One policy decision that hinders the actions to combat sexual exploitation on the Internet is making economic growth and development of the Internet a priority, and to do nothing to impede e-commerce.¹⁶⁰

Denial of the Harm

Since this is a report on the users, I will focus on the challenges to combating men's exploitative use of women and children for sex and abuse. The biggest problem in combating trafficking and sexual exploitation is the denial of the harm to women and children.

There is deep, pervasive denial of the harm of sexual exploitation throughout the world. The sexual exploitation of women has been normalized by the sex industry. There are massive amounts of pornography readily available on the Internet, with no limits on how transgressive, violent or degrading the images are. The women are always smiling, implying that they are consenting and enjoying the acts, even when they are painful and humiliating.

The users who sexually exploit women and children defend their rights and actions. They frequently portray themselves, even child sex abusers, as victims of oppression and intolerance. In the users' view, groups opposing sexual exploitation and even child pornography are attempting to oppress the users' right to pursue their pleasure and express their "love" for children.¹⁶¹

Society has become accepting of these images of sexual exploitation, and no longer questions them. Men and women, who don't have an understanding of the implications of some images, can easily come to believe that any and all sex acts are acceptable and enjoyable to women. Even law enforcement officials dedicated to fighting trafficking and exploitation often use pornographic language and terms to describe what is done to the women and children. In doing so they become complicit with the traffickers and users in the denial of the harm by minimizing or eroticizing the actions of the perpetrators.

The denial of the harm in attitude, policy and practice as resulted in there being no points of reference or standards to evaluate the images or understand the coercion going on behind the smiling faces of the women and children. The COPINE Project has found that:

*"Offenders talk of a lack of objective measure as to whether the child in the picture was actually being abused... A frequent comment refers to the smiling faces of the children in the pictures, as proof of their enjoyment, or personal fantasies of abuse which normalize the process of collecting."*¹⁶²

The following is a list of rationales and excuses that users of women in prostitution and pornography use to justify their decisions and choices to sexual exploit women. All of them deny or minimize the

harm to the women and children. These examples are taken from unsolicited emails that have been sent to me over the past few years.

1) Men need sex. Men have a greater sex drive than women that must be satisfied. Nothing can or should get in the way of men fulfilling this need

“The demand that creates prostitution is something that 90+% of men are born with: A strong sex urge. These customers come from all walks of life, a wide variety of personalities, financial status etc. Prostitution gives a large (continuously replenished) source of customers what they want: SEX.”¹⁶³

“God created us with certain needs. Just like we need food and shelter, so too we need sex. It is unnatural for a man to live without sex, just as it’s unnatural to live without shelter, even though it can be done. No man-made law can prevent men from pursuing sex, were it to become illegal to consume food, we wouldn’t stop eating, would we?”¹⁶⁴

“Unlike women men really do need sex. it’s not as vital as food or shelter but if a man is deprived of intimate touch and real sexual outlet long enough, he’ll gradually go crazy. some men can only get sex if they pay for it. womenkind has rejected them and they have no hope of love and long-term companionship. would you deprive them of any fulfillment? would you condemn them to a life devoid of sensual touch from a consenting adult? do you know what it’s like to need love (physical or otherwise) so badly for so long and only be able to get it for pay? prostitution not only should be legal but subsidized by the government just like food stamps.”¹⁶⁵

2) Some men lack the social skills to meet women and establish a relationship, therefore they have to buy sex from women in prostitution. As a result of rejection by women, they hate all women.

“As a lonely, ageing misfit with no family and almost no chance of meeting a woman here for any sort of affection I pay for it in SEA [South East Asia].”¹⁶⁶

“For a few years I spent my money and efforts into dating clubs. I asked many women to meet me. Though I joined several clubs and sent out countless cards and requests, the only answer I ever got as ‘no.’ I tried the personals in the papers and on the internet, sending out numerous notices to women and the only answer I got was ‘no.’ In my job I’ve asked quite a few female customers, in various polite ways, if they would please go out with me and – you guessed it – the only answer I got was ‘no.’ At the health club where I work out I’ve approached several women and netted on ‘yes’ answer (from a plain-looking and overweight woman), but she later rejected me without a single date. I’ve gone to bars and nightclubs and was ‘the invisible man.’ Women would look right through me and smile at the buy behind me. Once I printed hundreds of notices that anybody who finds me a date would receive a monetary reward. They had my phone number and e-mail address on them and I placed them on parked cars, hundreds at a time and 3 or 4 times. I never got a single phone call or email from that. You might think I’m horribly deformed, have no personality, or that I’m in awful physical shape. I am not too short and not too tall and I’m above average intelligence. I don’t smoke or drink and I’m very sensitive and kind to others. I used to feel bad when I read about a woman being beaten or killed by her boyfriend. Now I have no sympathy, whatsoever. Since it is the “bad boys” who women prefer, it is the bad boys they get and ‘bad’ means violent in many cases. Hey, at least they’re not boring like I am! I used to feel bad when a beautiful woman was killed, Now I say, “she would have had no use for me anyway and wouldn’t have missed me had I been killed.” Over the lonely years I’ve made peace with the fact that women hate me – now I hate them (as a group) and love only their bodies. ...I’ve never used a child prostitute and if anybody was abused it was me. I know there are ‘crack’ prostitutes out there but many, if not most, of the prostitutes do what they do out of pure free will and they feel the same way I do.”¹⁶⁷

“...there are considerate hard working, caring courteous young men such as myself who would want nothing more than to have a wife to love, but have NO social skills. The only contact a man can have with a woman sexually or other wise, who has no social skills is to engage someone for escort services.

This western European culture exacerbates communication between men and women. Women in urban settings literally hate men with no social skills. Imagine being give the silent treatment for all of your adult and adolescent life, simply because one dos not know how to start a conversation with a woman. The wrong approach can ... land one in jail for sexual harassment charges. ... I don't believe prostitution is right but men without social skills need intimacy too.”¹⁶⁸

3) Men are financially supporting poor women and their families.

“I support these women whenever I can, and my friends to as well. In most countries they are the sole support of the children, as the ‘man’ has long since left. In latin American a woman can make three dollars a day working in a store, or she can make \$100.00 by servicing a tourist. What would you do?” If it weren't for prostitution, a lot of children would go hungry in this world, as there are often no alternates for a source of reasonable income.”¹⁶⁹

“At least we men are decent enough to pay for it and in doing so help to support families and whole economies.”¹⁷⁰

4) Prostitution is just like any other job.

“I'm a man. I buy the services of a roofer to use his/her body to install a roof on my house. I spare myself the frustration of trying to do it myself. I pay the roofer. Have I abused a roofer? I'm not nuts about working, but it does pay the rent. A dishwasher might not have gone to college to study hydrology to become an excellent dishwasher, but he/she does this job day in day out until they move on. Here is a prostitute (assuming she wasn't kidnapped and forced into this) who says ‘pay this much and you get this much sex.’ Is this so wrong (especially for an ugly single guy)?”¹⁷¹

5) Western women are no longer feminine.

[From a British man] *“...if the women in the west acted a little more feminine than they do right now, i don't think the men would be lured to the east by these lovely ladies. I personally have been to Thailand 7 times, and in fact married a thai lady, and i am not saying i agree with it, but selling their bodies gives them a much higher standard of living than they would otherwise attain.”¹⁷²*

Finally, there is this comment from a man who does not try to rationalize, excuse or defend his decision to sexual exploit women. He just states his and other men's behavior as what men are and do.

“...most men (ask a couple if you like) see sex as simple erotic enjoyment and just plain FUN!!! Men are men and you ...will never change us. Of that I'm sure. ...write all you want as it is indeed you right but we all know that it will change nothing at all. Men will continue to use the Internet to go on looking for wives in other countries, go on sex tours to Costa Rica or the Philippines, search for escorts, and basically just be men. I for one have no problem with it at all.”¹⁷³

At present these excuses, rationalizes and attitudes are commonly accepted throughout the world. One of the challenges to ending trafficking and sexual exploitation is to change these attitudes.

Disconnection Between Acts and Images

One of the fundamental questions that this inquiry addresses is the connection between the physical trafficking and sexual exploitation of women and children and the images produced of those crimes. In the areas of sexual exploitation there is a strong disconnection between acts and images. Only in child pornography has the link between acts and image been maintained, with an image being considered the pictorial evidence of abuse. Asking the question about the impact of the use of communications and information technologies on trafficking in women and children for sexual exploitation takes us to the links between acts and images.

Perpetrators and profiteers of sexual exploitation will argue strongly for maintaining the disconnection between acts and images. Human and women's rights advocates and those defending the democratic rights of citizens to dignity and freedom have to connect the acts and images. Asking about the use of new technologies and trafficking for sexual exploitation takes us into cyberspace, a place that seems to exist without physical embodiment, but in fact is a very real, physical network of electronic components, wiring, cables, and program code. The images and videos of sexual exploitation that are found on the Internet have just as much basis in reality as cyberspace. With the exception of virtual or animated images, every image is produced by recording the acts of real people.

The challenge is to change attitudes, policies and laws that connect the acts and images in ways that preserve rights of freedom of expression, but protect the rights of women and children to be free of criminal acts of trafficking and sexual exploitation.

References

-
- ¹ Marsha Liss, Child Exploitation and Obscenity Unit, U.S. Department of Justice, 15 May 2001.
- ² Frank Rich, "Naked capitalists – There's no business like porn business," *New York Times*, 20 May 2001.
- ³ Rich, 20 May 2001.
- ⁴ Interview, Raymond Smith, Fraud, Child Exploitation and Asset Forfeiture Group, Office of Criminal Investigations, U.S. Postal Inspection Service, 7 May 2001.
- ⁵ Interview, Smith, 7 May 2001.
- ⁶ James F. McLaughlin, "Cyber Child Sex Offender Typology," 2001, <<http://www.ci.keene.nh.us/police/Typology.html> >
- ⁷ Max Taylor, Ethel Quayle and Gemma Holland, "Child Pornography, the Internet and Offending," 2000
- ⁸ Taylor, Holland and Quayle, 2000
- ⁹ McLaughlin, 2001.
- ¹⁰ Karen Kaplan, "Pushing porn on DVDs," *Los Angeles Times*, 9 January 2001.
- ¹¹ Rich, 20 May 2001.
- ¹² Kaplan, 9 January 2001.
- ¹³ Kaplan, 9 January 2001.
- ¹⁴ Press Release, "KSEXradio.com tops 100,000 daily hits," 11 January 2001.
- ¹⁵ Beate Uhse AG, Gutenbergstrasse 12, 24941 Flensburg, Germany, < <http://www.beate-uhse.com> >
- ¹⁶ Private Media Group, Inc., Carreteria de Rubi 22-26, 08190 San Cugat del Valles, Barcelona, Spain, < <http://www.prvt.com/flash/start.asp> >
- ¹⁷ Source unknown, Spring 2001.
- ¹⁸ Andrea Orr, "No wireless screen is too small for porn," *Reuters*, 25 May 2001.
- ¹⁹ --- "Eastern Europe--Hit the Road," *The Economist*, 19 March 2001.
- ²⁰ Interview, Glenn Nick, U.S. Customs Cyber Smuggling Center, 17 May 2001
- ²¹ Taylor, Quayle and Holland, 2000
- ²² Interview, Jeff Middleton, Computer Focus, USA, 17 May 2001
- ²³ --- "Gnutella -Welcome to Gnutella," <<http://gnuella.wego.com>> Accessed 1 May 2001
- ²⁴ --- Ron Harris, "Gnutella gives copyright holders headaches," *Associated Press*, 10 April 2000.
- ²⁵ Jesse Berst, "How Napster and friends will turn the Web inside out," *ZDNet*, 24 April 2000.
- ²⁶ Berst, 24 April 2000.
- ²⁷ Interview, Nick, 17 May 2001.
- ²⁸ Personal communication, Amy Potenza, Research Assistant, University of Rhode Island, 24 May 2001.
- ²⁹ Taylor, Quayle and Holland, 2000
- ³⁰ Personal communication, Valerie Balding, Researcher, Leeds Metropolitan University, May 2001.
- ³¹ Euan Grant, HM Customs and Excise National Analytical Center, UK, 8 May 2001.
- ³² Personal communication, Valdis Pumpurs, Head, Criminal Police of Latvia, May 2001.
- ³³ Sheila Toomey, "INS accuses four strippers for cultural excesses," *Anchorage Daily News*, 6 January 2001.
- ³⁴ Toomey, 10 January 2000.
- ³⁵ Sheila Toomey, "Russian dancer case deferred until June," *Anchorage Daily News*, 16 March 2001.
- ³⁶ Interview, James M. Chaparro, Director, Anti-Smuggling and Trafficking Unit, U.S. Immigration and Naturalization Service, 1 May 2001.
- ³⁷ Denmark Police, *Report on the 'Fact-Finding Mission' conducted in November 2000 by the National Commissioner of Police for the Baltic Countries Regarding Trafficking in Women*, 2000.
- ³⁸ Interview, Lisbet Jørgensen, Denmark Police, 2 May 2001.
- ³⁹ Denmark Police, 2000.

-
- ⁴⁰ Kevin G. Hall, "E-prostitution – The oldest profession is buoyed by newest technology," *Chicago Tribune*, 17 January 2001.
- ⁴¹ Internet Crime Forum IRC Sub-Group, *Chat Wise, Street Wise – Children and Internet Chat Services*, March 2001.
- ⁴² Commerce Net, "Chat room use in North America," 30 August 2000.
- ⁴³ Internet Crime Forum, March 2001.
- ⁴⁴ Internet Crime Forum, March 2001.
- ⁴⁵ Internet Crime Forum, March 2001.
- ⁴⁶ Internet Crime Forum, March 2001.
- ⁴⁷ Personal communication, Balding, May 2001.
- ⁴⁸ Richard Barry, *Chatroom Danger – The Making of the Tina Bell Diaries*, 15 March 2001.
- ⁴⁹ Barry, 15 March 2001.
- ⁵⁰ Barry, 15 March 2001.
- ⁵¹ Barry, 15 March 2001.
- ⁵² Interview, April Hindin, Postal Inspector, Tampa, Florida, 15 May 2001.
- ⁵³ --- "Man faces 308-count indictment related to alleged sex acts with girls," *Associated Press*, 24 January 2001.
- ⁵⁴ Jill King Greenwood, "Missing-girl case points to Greece; 2 suspects charged," *Tampa Tribune*, 27 January 2001, p. 12.
- ⁵⁵ --- "Missing teen found, says she doesn't want to go home," *Athens News*, 2 February 2001.
- ⁵⁶ --- "German man charged with luring Florida girl overseas," *Associated Press*, 3 February 2001.
- ⁵⁷ "German man arrested," 3 February 2001.
- ⁵⁸ --- "German suspected of links with pornography rings," *Athens News*, 6 February 2001.
- ⁵⁹ --- "Missing teen found, says she doesn't want to go home," *Athens News*, 2 February 2001.
- ⁶⁰ Eileen Gongora, "Pedophiles prey on children via Internet," *Star Banner*, 17 May 2001.
- ⁶¹ Toni Heinzl, "Web site had 'child porn' link, detective testifies," *Fort Worth Star-Telegram*, 29 November 2000.
- ⁶² Interview, Marshal Heeger, U.S. Assistant Customs Attaché, Moscow, Russia, 3 November 2000.
- ⁶³ Terry Frieden, "Russia, U.S. arrest suspects in global child porn ring," *CNN*, 26 March 2001.
- ⁶⁴ Press Release, U.S. Customs Service, "U.S. Customs Service, Russian Police take down global child pornography Web site," 26 March 2001.
- ⁶⁵ Hall, 17 January 2001.
- ⁶⁶ Personal communication, Pumpurs, May 2001.
- ⁶⁷ Anonymous source, UK, May 2001.
- ⁶⁸ --- "Immigration raid closes Internet porn site," *Associated Press*, 15 January 2000.
- ⁶⁹ Interview, Omer Poirier, U.S. Attorney, Honolulu, Hawaii, 1 May 2001.
- ⁷⁰ Interview, Chaparro, 1 May 2001.
- ⁷¹ Interview, Omer Poirier, U.S. Attorney, Honolulu, Hawaii, 1 May 2001.
- ⁷² Slave Farm, < <http://www.slavefarm.com> >, Accessed 7 July 2000.
- ⁷³ <<http://www.borov.com>>, Accessed 26 February 2001.
- ⁷⁴ Interview, Jeff Middleton, Computer Focus, USA, 17 May 2001
- ⁷⁵ Liz Kelly and Dianne Butterworth, "Women's perspectives – Pornography and the Internet," *Policing the Internet – Combating Pornography and Violence on the Internet – A European Approach*, Conference, London, UK, 13-14 February 1999.
- ⁷⁶ Interview, Middleton, 17 May 2001
- ⁷⁷ J. Robert Flores, "Statement of J. Robert Flores, Esq., Vice President and Senior Counsel, National Law Center for Children and Families before the Committee on Commerce, Subcommittee on Telecommunications, Trade, and Consumer Protection; Hearings on Obscene Material Available via the Internet," 23 May 2000.
- ⁷⁸ --- "Questioning porn," *Los Angeles Times*, 19 May 2001.

-
- ⁷⁹ Sara Gaines, "Police are getting organized to catch crooks who thought the net offered a perfect forum," *The Guardian*, 26 April 2001.
- ⁸⁰ Taylor, Quayle and Holland, 2000.
- ⁸¹ Taylor, Quayle and Holland, 2000.
- ⁸² Taylor, Holland and Quayle, 2000
- ⁸³ Taylor, Holland and Quayle, 2000
- ⁸⁴ BBC Documentary, "The Feminism of Andrea Dworkin"
- ⁸⁵ Max Taylor, "The nature and dimensions of child pornography on the Internet," Combating Child Pornography on the Internet, Vienna, 29 Sept – 1 October 1999, < <http://www.stop-childpornog.at>>
- ⁸⁶ Taylor, Holland and Quayle, 2000
- ⁸⁷ Interview, Smith, 7 May 2001.
- ⁸⁸ Angela K. Brown, "Jury convicts Fort Worth couple on nearly 90 counts of child porn." *Associated Press*, 1 December 2000.
- ⁸⁹ Toni Heinzl, "Jurors selected to hear Internet child porn case," *Forth Worth Star-Telegram*, 28 November 2000.
- ⁹⁰ Heinzl, 29 November 2000.
- ⁹¹ Toni Heinzl, "Detective portrays victims of child porn; Prosecutors present chilling account," *Fort Worth Star-Telegram*, 1 December 2000.
- ⁹² Brown, 1 December 2000.
- ⁹³ Press Release, "Breakthrough cited in war against child porn," 16 February 2001.
- ⁹⁴ Interview, Paul McCarthy, Assistant Attorney General, Attorney General's Criminal Prosecutions Bureau, 21 May 2001.
- ⁹⁵ Taylor, Quayle and Holland, 2000.
- ⁹⁶ Taylor, Quayle, and Holland, 2000
- ⁹⁷ Taylor, Quayle, and Holland, 2000
- ⁹⁸ Taylor, Quayle and Holland, 2000.
- ⁹⁹ McLaughlin, 2001.
- ¹⁰⁰ McLaughlin, 2001.
- ¹⁰¹ McLaughlin, 2001.
- ¹⁰² McLaughlin, 2001.
- ¹⁰³ James F. McLaughlin, "Technophilia: A Modern Day Paraphilia," *Knight Stick: Publication of the New Hampshire Police Association*, Spring/Summer 1998, Vol. 51, 47-51, <<http://www.ci.keene.nh.us/police/technophilia.html>>
- ¹⁰⁴ McLaughlin, Spring/Summer 1998.
- ¹⁰⁵ Internet Crime Forum, March 2001.
- ¹⁰⁶ National Center for Missing and Exploited Children, *Online Victimization – A Report on the Nation's Youth*, June 2000.
- ¹⁰⁷ McLaughlin, 2001.
- ¹⁰⁸ Interview, Bruce Taylor, Director, National Law Center for Families and Children, 16 May 2001.
- ¹⁰⁹ McLaughlin, 2001.
- ¹¹⁰ --- "Epicenter of child porn – Eastern Europe and Russia, < <http://m-net.arboret.org/~asp/manufacture.html>>, Accessed 25 February 2001.
- ¹¹¹ James Geary, "Sex, Lies and Budapest – As producers of sex films flock there, Hungary's capital is becoming Europe's porn capital as well," *Time*, 24 March 1997, Vol 149, No. 12.
- ¹¹² F Rich, 20 May 2001.
- ¹¹³ "Questioning porn," 19 May 2001.
- ¹¹⁴ Frank Rich, "Naked capitalists – There's no business like porn business," *New York Times*, 20 May 2001.
- ¹¹⁵ Datamonitor, UK.
- ¹¹⁶ Rich, 20 May 2001.
- ¹¹⁷ Rich, 20 May 2001.

-
- ¹¹⁸ Rich, 20 May 2001.
- ¹¹⁹ Rich, 20 May 2001.
- ¹²⁰ Natasha Singer, "Blue Danube – The story of Budapest's booming export: The skin flick," <http://www.nerve.com/Photography/Plachy/BlueDanube/>, Accessed 25 February 2001.
- ¹²¹ --- "To its buyers and sellers, the sex trade is just another business," < <http://www.pirko.de/lustig/Sex.html> > Accessed 25 February 2001.
- ¹²² Geary, 24 March 1997.
- ¹²³ Singer, 25 February 2001.
- ¹²⁴ Updated Company Press Release, "Elegant Angel owner Patrick Collins back in Europe," 10 May 2000.
- ¹²⁵ Singer, 25 February 2001.
- ¹²⁶ Singer, 25 February 2001.
- ¹²⁷ --- "To its buyers and sellers, the sex trade is just another business," < <http://www.pirko.de/lustig/Sex.html> > Accessed 25 February 2001.
- ¹²⁸ Fedor Lukyanov, "'Alive goods' is flow from the East," *Rosiysskaya Gazeta* (Budapest), http://www.rg.ru/english/eco_soyuz/03_11_1.htm, 27 May 2000.
- ¹²⁹ Lukyanov, 27 May 2000.
- ¹³⁰ Max Taylor, Gemma Holland and Ethel Quayle. 2000. "Typology of Paedophile Picture Collections," COPINE Project, Child Studies Unit, Department of Applied Psychology, University of Cork, Ireland.
- ¹³¹ James F. McLaughlin, 1998
- ¹³² Alan Cohen, "No Web for you!" *Fortune*, 30 October 2000.
- ¹³³ Websense, Inc., "Websense Web@Work survey reveals employers are paying the price for net addiction," Websense Press Release, 19 April 2001.
- ¹³⁴ Websense, Inc. "Cyberslacking – How big a problem is it and what can be done to prevent it?" *Websense European Press Releases*, 2000.
- ¹³⁵ Lisa Guernsey, "Hardly working, really surfing," www.eMarketer.com, 7 February 2000.
- ¹³⁶ Interview, Middleton, 17 May 2001.
- ¹³⁷ --- "Aker hackers caught red-handed," *Harts Daily Petroleum*, 22 October 1998.
- ¹³⁸ --- "Britain – Defence scientist suspended over Internet porn," *Agence France-Presse*, 21 June 1998.
- ¹³⁹ --- "Workplace productivity, Workplace porn surfers on the up in UK," < <http://cooltech.iafrica.com/technews/2655566.htm> >, 23 April 2001.
- ¹⁴⁰ --- "Oil company sacks four workers over Internet porn," *Scotsman*, 31 July 1998.
- ¹⁴¹ --- "If you don't want to lose your job, think twice before hitting the button," *Europe Intelligence Wire*, 6 December 1999.
- ¹⁴² --- "Internet misuse in the news, Content filtering for the Web gains foothold in corporate market," *Wall Street Journal Europe*, 11 April 2001.
- ¹⁴³ Greg Miller, "Fired by big brother," *Los Angeles Times*, 27 January 2001.
- ¹⁴⁴ Jeff Siegel, "Monitoring their monitors," *American Way Magazine*, 15 January 2001.
- ¹⁴⁵ Siegel, 15 January 2001.
- ¹⁴⁶ --- "Dow fires about 50 for porn, violent emails," *Excite News*, 28 July 2000.
- ¹⁴⁷ Jack Boulware, "Fishing for smut – The Canadian government is cracking down on sex-related Internet surfing," *salon.com*, 26 April 2000.
- ¹⁴⁸ Paul Sperry, "Cyberporn scandal hits Commerce Department, Personnel security office suspended; follows HUD, White House abuses," *WorldNetDaily.com*, 27 September 2001.
- ¹⁴⁹ --- "CIA probes employees' computer use," *Excite News*, 12 November 2000.
- ¹⁵⁰ --- "Hungarian parliament filters out porn," *Ananova*, 26 March 2001.
- ¹⁵¹ --- "Streaming tears as unwary firms catch cold," *Birmingham Post*, 17 April 2001.
- ¹⁵² Websense, Inc. 2000.
- ¹⁵³ Interview, Middleton, 17 May 2001
- ¹⁵⁴ "Workplace productivity," 23 April 2001.
- ¹⁵⁵ Flores, 23 May 2000.

-
- ¹⁵⁶ Interview, Middleton, 17 May 2001.
- ¹⁵⁷ --- "Porn exposure created hostile climate for librarians," *Minneapolis Star-Tribune*, 25 May 2001.
- ¹⁵⁸ --- "Teenagers and new media," *Financial Times Limited*, 7 March 2001.
- ¹⁵⁹ Kevin DiGregory, "Fighting Cybercrime-What are the Challenges facing Europe?" *Meeting Before the European Parliament*, 19 September 2000.
- ¹⁶⁰ Janet Reno, "United States Department of Justice Keynote Address at the ITAA Cybercrime Summit: A Law Enforcement/IT Industry Dialogue on Prevention, Detection, Investigation and Cooperation, 19 June 2000, <
<http://www.cybercrime.gov/agcybersumm.htm> >
- ¹⁶¹ Carol Linehan, COPINE Project, University College, Cork, Ireland, "Virtual Paedophile Communities," Paper presented at the NOTA Conference, Dublin, Ireland, September 2000.
- ¹⁶² Taylor, Quayle and Holland, 2000.
- ¹⁶³ Jeff, "Legalization or prostitution, violence against women, etc." Received 15 June 2000.
- ¹⁶⁴ Unknown, undated
- ¹⁶⁵ rhayat, "prostitution," Received 17 June 1998.
- ¹⁶⁶ Peter, "your info," Received 22 May 1999.
- ¹⁶⁷ Unknown, undated.
- ¹⁶⁸ "Why is it the Oldest Profession," Received 29 November 1999.
- ¹⁶⁹ Marcos, "save the women?" Received 4 October 1998.
- ¹⁷⁰ Peter, "your info," Received 22 May 1999.
- ¹⁷¹ Jeff, "Legalization or prostitution, violence against women, etc." Received 15 June 2000
- ¹⁷² Michael, "your article on trafficking of women," Received 26 July 2000.
- ¹⁷³ David, "What a load of you know what!!!" Received 13 May 2001.